



STATE OF INDIANA

MITCHELL E. DANIELS, JR., Governor

PUBLIC ACCESS COUNSELOR
JOSEPH B. HOAGE

Indiana Government Center South
402 West Washington Street, Room W470
Indianapolis, Indiana 46204-2745
Telephone: (317) 234-0906
Fax: (317) 233-3091
1-800-228-6013
www.IN.gov/pac

October 12, 2012

Mr. Randall Tison
DOC 127788
P.O. Box 1111
Carlisle, Indiana 47838

Re: Formal Complaint 12-FC-273; Alleged Violation of the Access to Public Records Act by the Vanderburgh County Superior Court

Dear Mr. Tison:

This advisory opinion is in response to your formal complaint alleging the Vanderburgh County Superior Court ("Court") violated the Access to Public Records Act ("APRA"), Ind. Code § 5-14-3-1 *et seq.* Our office forwarded a copy of your formal complaint to the Court on September 19, 2012. As of today's date, we have yet to receive a response.

BACKGROUND

In your formal complaint, you allege that you submitted a written request for records to the Court on September 4, 2012. You further allege that your request was denied by the Court on September 10, 2012, with no reason provided.

ANALYSIS

The public policy of the APRA states that "(p)roviding persons with information is an essential function of a representative government and an integral part of the routine duties of public officials and employees, whose duty it is to provide the information." *See* I.C. § 5-14-3-1. The Court is a public agency for the purposes of the APRA. *See* I.C. § 5-14-3-2. Accordingly, any person has the right to inspect and copy the Court's public records during regular business hours unless the records are excepted from disclosure as confidential or otherwise nondisclosable under the APRA. *See* I.C. § 5-14-3-3(a).

A request for records may be oral or written. *See* I.C. § 5-14-3-3(a); § 5-14-3-9(c). If the request is delivered in person and the agency does not respond within 24 hours, the request is deemed denied. *See* I.C. § 5-14-3-9(a). If the request is delivered by mail or facsimile and the agency does not respond to the request within seven (7) days *of receipt*, the request is deemed denied (emphasis added). *See* I.C. § 5-14-3-9(b). Under the

APRA, when a request is made in writing and the agency denies the request, the agency must deny the request in writing and include a statement of the specific exemption or exemptions authorizing the withholding of all or part of the record and the name and title or position of the person responsible for the denial. *See* I.C. § 5-14-3-9(c). A response from the public agency could be an acknowledgement that the request has been received and information regarding how or when the agency intends to comply.

Under section 4 of the APRA, a public agency may not disclose records declared confidential by or under rules adopted by the supreme court of Indiana. I.C. § 5-14-3-4(a)(8). Confidentiality of court records is governed chiefly by Administrative Rule 9, which was adopted by the Indiana Supreme Court. The rule applies to court records, which is defined as both case records and administrative records. Admin. R. 9(C)(1). “Case record” means any document, information, data, or other item created, collected, received, or maintained by a court, court agency or clerk of court in connection with a particular case. Admin. R. 9(C)(2). All persons have access to court records as provided in Administrative Rule 9. Admin. R. 9(B)(1). However, some case records are confidential, pursuant to Administrative Rule 9(G). Administrative Rule 9 deems confidential information excluded from public access by specific court order. Admin. R. 9(G)(1)(c). Further, courts have the authority to seal court records in accordance with I.C. § 5-14-3-5.5.

“[T]he APRA governs access to the public records of a public agency that exist; the failure to produce public records that do not exist or are not maintained by the public agency is not a denial under the APRA.” *Opinion of the Public Access Counselor 01-FC-61*; *see also Opinion of the Public Access Counselor 08-FC-113* (“If the records do not exist, certainly the [agency] could not be required to produce a copy....”). If the Court does not maintain any records that were responsive to the request, it would not act contrary to the APRA by failing to produce any records. I would also note that that the APRA requires public agencies to maintain and preserve public records in accordance with applicable retention schedules. *See* I.C. § 5-14-3-4(e). If the Court no longer maintains the records that are responsive to your request and said records were disposed of pursuant to the applicable retention schedule, it would have acted in compliance with the APRA.

Without the benefit of a response from the Court, it is unclear to me why your request was denied. Under the APRA, a public agency that withholds a public record bears the burden of proof to show that the record is exempt. *See* I.C. §§ 5-14-3-1, 5-14-3-9(f), (g). Exceptions to disclosure are narrowly construed. *See* I.C. § 5-14-3-1. As the Court has not provided a justification for withholding the records at issue here, it is my opinion that it has failed to sustain its burden and acted contrary to the requirements of section 9(c) of the APRA in denying your request.



STATE OF INDIANA

MITCHELL E. DANIELS, JR., Governor

PUBLIC ACCESS COUNSELOR
JOSEPH B. HOAGE

Indiana Government Center South
402 West Washington Street, Room W470
Indianapolis, Indiana 46204-2745
Telephone: (317) 234-0906
Fax: (317) 233-3091
1-800-228-6013
www.IN.gov/pac

CONCLUSION

For the foregoing reasons, it is my opinion that the Court acted contrary to the APRA by failing to comply with the requirements of section 9(c) of the APRA in denying your request for records.

Best regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "J. Hoage".

Joseph B. Hoage
Public Access Counselor

cc: Vanderburgh County Court