BEFORE THE
NATURAL RESOURCES COMMISSION
OF THE
STATE OF INDIANA

IN THE MATTER OF:
 )
 )
PETITION FOR RATE INCREASE ) ADMINISTRATIVE CAUSE
BY HOOSIER HILLS MARINA, INC. ) NUMBER: 18-130P

REPORT OF HEARING OFFICER WITH PROPOSED FINDINGS
AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE U.S. ARMY CORPS OF ENGINEERS BY THE
NATURAL RESOURCES COMMISSION

1. Petition For Rate Increase By Hoosier Hills Marina, Inc.

On December 12, 2018, Victor Polen (Polen), on behalf of Hoosier Hills Marina, Inc. (Hoosier Hills), submitted a request for rate increase for 261 of Hoosier Hills’ 267 slips to the Department of Natural Resources (Department). On January 4, 2019, Polen submitted an amended request (Petition) to clarify that in addition to the rate increase, Hoosier Hills is also seeking a permanent rate establishment for its “20 x 80 extended single berth, open slip…which was approved as an interim rate by the [Department]” on January 2, 2019. If approved, the proposed rate establishment and increases of “1.5% to 2% across nearly all slips” would become effective on January 1, 2020. The Petition is attached as Exhibit A.

Polen expressed in the Petition that “CPI running at 2.5% for 2018” impacted costs associated with operation and maintenance of Hoosier Hills and explained that storm damage experienced by other marinas has caused insurance costs to significantly increase as well. Polen observed that over $1 million dollars has been invested in Hoosier Hills in the last 24 months. Polen identified that certain financial expenditures are attributed to maintenance items such a broken anchor cables and upgrading the propane fill station to bring it into compliance with required codes. While maintenance is clearly important, it also represents a routine cost of operation. However, Polen also noted that Hoosier Hills’ has constructed a new dock as well as a new service and storage shop.

To afford the Hearing Officer the ability to compare Hoosier Hills to contemporary marinas identified in the Petition as comparables, Polen explained that Hoosier Hills’ covered dock are “all concrete and at a
level above most of the comparators” and that the open slips while of significant age, are also in a condition equivalent to the comparators provided. Polen highlighted a large number of amenities offered by Hoosier Hills including water service throughout the winter for House Boat slips, close loading/unloading that Polen describes as better than all comparators, restroom facilities, including showers that are open throughout the winter, as well as a new closed circuit video/security system that is equal to or better than all other comparators. Polen pointed out that Hoosier Hills offers sales and service for all types of watercraft as well as sales and service of necessary watercraft amenities such as generators. He also highlighted an expanded restaurant menu and plans to expand concierge service.

2. **SCOPE OF REVIEW**

Requests for rate establishment or increase are evaluated by the Commission under Information Bulletin #20 (Fifth Amendment) *(IB #20)*, as posted in the Indiana *Register* at 20170524-IR-312170263NRA on May 24, 2017. IB #20 is provided as guidance on the informal process for Commission review of ratemaking requests made by resorts and marinas operating under a lease with the Department.

Consistent with the requirements set forth in IB #20, Hoosier Hills submitted its Petition to the Department, and a copy to the Commission, before January 1 of the year preceding the year in which the proposed rates, if approved, will be implemented.

3. **HEARING OFFICER ASSIGNMENT AND NOTIFICATION TO RENTERS**

Section 3 of IB #20 provides for the assignment of a Hearing Officer and the dissemination of information concerning a request for rate establishment or increase as follows:

(A) The [Commission] will assign a cause number and hearing officer. By February 1, the Department shall notify the lessee of the assigned administrative cause number, identity of the hearing officer, and hearing officer's electronic mail address.

(B) By March 1, the lessee shall provide written notice, by personal delivery, U.S. first class mail, or by electronic mail, to each slip renter or buoy renter that the lessee is requesting a rate establishment or increase associated with slips or other mooring facilities, including buoys and docking stations. The notice shall include the proposed rates and advise the renter that a rate hearing will be scheduled only upon submission of requests for rate hearing by ten percent (10%) of the renters within fifteen (15) days … The lessee shall also provide the renter with the hearing officer's electronic mail address. Not later than March 15, the lessee shall provide the Hearings Division with a copy of the notice and a listing that includes the names of persons notified and the method of service under this paragraph….
Sandra L. Jensen, the Director of the Commission’s Division of Hearings, was assigned as the Hearing Officer. Jensen advised Polen of her assignment as the Hearing Officer and provided him with her contact information and the assigned administrative cause number.

Polen, on behalf of Hoosier Hills, filed an affidavit as required by IB #20, on March 4, 2019 confirming that slip renters were notified of the proposed rates, the deadline for requesting a rate hearing, and the mailing address and the email address at which requests for a rate hearing could be sent.

No qualifying written comment to either support or oppose any of the requested rates, was received by the Division of Hearings or the Hearing Officer1. The Hearing Officer received no request for rate hearing and no rate hearing was scheduled.

4. **Comparable Analysis and Department Recommendation**

Upon receipt of a ratemaking request from a marina, the Department’s Division of State Parks is tasked with analyzing the rates of comparable marinas. *IB#20, Sec.3(E)*. In Hoosier Hills’ Petition, Polen identified Conley Bottom Resort (Lake Cumberland, Monticello, Kentucky), Lee’s Ford (Lake Cumberland, Nancy, Kentucky), Patoka Lake Marina; Fourwinds Resort & Marina (Monroe Reservoir), Kent’s Harbor & Sagamore Resort (Brookville Reservoir), Geist Marina, Morse Marina, and Lake Cumberland State Dock (Lake Cumberland, Monticello, Kentucky) as comparable marinas.

On March 15, 2019, Melissa Stewart (Stewart), Concession/Contract Program Manager for the Department’s Division of State Parks, provided a report of her evaluation and recommendation regarding Hoosier Hills’ Petition. Stewart’s report is attached as Exhibit B. In her evaluation Stewart observed that Hoosier Hills most recently sought a rate increase for implementation in 2018. She noted that the Department has received complaints from Hoosier Hills’ guests regarding the proposed rate increases but observed them to be “normal complaints that can be expected with raising fees.”2 Stewart

---

1 One comment was received from a person who did not identify himself or herself. In accordance with Information Bulletin #55 (Third Amendment), as posted in the Indiana Register at 20170524-IR-312170259NRA on May 24, 2017, the Commission’s Hearing Officers are disallowed from considering comments received from anonymous sources.

2 No qualifying complaints or comments were made to the Hearing Officer or the Commission as required by IB #20 or IB #55.
reported that past inspections, along with a March 13, 2019 inspection revealed older “fair to good
condition” docks and an operation that addresses safety issues promptly. Stewart concluded that the
condition of Hoosier Hills along with the amenities provided are similar in nature to the marinas
identified by Polen as comparable marinas. The comparison of Hoosier Hills to these marinas resulted
in Stewart’s conclusion that Hoosier Hills should “be granted their requested increases as they were
found to be reasonable and justified.”

Stewart also observed that the Request is seeking rate increases of only 1.5% - 2.0% for identified slips
but is also seeking the Commission’s recommendation regarding the establishment of a rate for a new
20’ x 80’ extended single berth, open slip, for which the Department granted an interim rate approval for
2019.

5. **DEPARTMENT INTERIM RATE APPROVAL FOR NEW RATE**

The Commission has delegated to the Department the ability to set an interim rate for any new and
different slip that first becomes available after January 1st of any year such that the Commission is
unable to establish a permanent rate in a timely manner to allow the marina to put the new slip into
service. *IB #20, Sec. 7.* A marina is permitted to charge the interim rate for only one season before
seeking the establishment of a permanent rate from the Commission. *Id.*

Hoosier Hills established a new 20’ x 80’ extended single berth, open slip for which the Department
established an interim rate of $5,300 on January 2, 2019, which will be in effect until January 1, 2020.
Polen seeks, through this ratemaking to have the Commission endorse the interim rate previously
approved by the Department.

6. **HEARING OFFICER ANALYSIS**

Each of the marinas from which rates were identified by Polen qualifies as a “comparable marina” in
that each is located within 400 miles and provides similar amenities to the amenities offered at Hoosier
Hills. *Information Bulletin #20, Section 2(B).*
When no rate hearing is required and a request seeks increases of less than 2.0%, the Commission has delegated authority for the Hearing Officer, in consultation with the Department, to act as its delegate in submitting the necessary written findings and recommendation as to rates to the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers. *Information Bulletin #20, Section 3(G).*

However, the establishment of a rate for the 20’ x 80’ extended single berth, open slip requires Commission recommendation to the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers. Furthermore, through the evaluation of Hoosier Hills’ Petition, Jensen observed that the list of slip sizes and rates provided by Polen were not identical to the lists of slip sizes and rates most recently granted approval by the Commission in 2003, 2017 and 2018. *Administrative Cause Numbers 03-072P, 16-167P, and 17-128P,* respectively. Polen has adequately explained the discrepancies but for clarity and transparency purposes, Jensen believes it to be appropriate to fully explain and clearly obtain Commission endorsement of the rates for these different slip sizes.

The ratemaking for Hoosier Hills under Administrative Cause Number 16-167P was initiated by Jeff Dukes (*Dukes*), who operated Hoosier Hills until near 2017. In response to Jensen’s inquiry about the existence of slips in sizes and with rates not previously approved by the Commission, Polen explained that since assuming responsibility for Hoosier Hills in 2017, he has undertaken the task of “clarifying each slip size.” *Polen April 1, 2010 email.* Polen’s endeavor revealed that the slip sizes previously identified by Dukes were not exact and that some slips were being rented at rates approved for larger slip sizes. The discrepancy in the list of slip sizes and, in some cases rates, provided with the Petition reflects an effort on the part of Polen to more accurately identify the slip sizes and more appropriately correlate rates to the actual sizes. More particularly, Polen explained as follows:

a) The slip size previously identified to be 16’ x 50’ with an approved rate of $2,800 actually measures 18’ x 50’ in size. Even though the slip is actually two feet larger, Hoosier Hills has continued to rent this double berth, open slip at the rate approved for the smaller size and is now seeking to increase that rate by 2% to $2,856. *Polen April 1, 2019 email.*

b) Slips previously identified as 20’ x 75’ with an approved rate of $4,550, actually have a 70’ finger on one side and an 80’ finger on the other side. This slip size, still rented at a rate of $4,550, is now identified as 20’ x 70’ single extended, open slip. Hoosier Hills is proposing to increase that rate by 2% to $4,641. *Id.*
c) Hoosier Hills has 18’ x 80’ single berth, open slips that had previously been “lumped into” the category of 20’ x 80’ single berth, open slips with rent charged at the Commission approved rate for 20’ x 80’ sized slips of $4,850. Administrative Cause Number 16-167P. Polen discounted the rate for these smaller slips, actually sized 18’ x 80’, to $4,600 instead of continuing to rent them at a rate approved for a larger slip. Through this ratemaking, Hoosier Hills is seeking the Commission’s approval of a 2% increase above the discounted rate for the 18’ x 80’ single berth, open slip, which would set the rate at $4,692. Polen April 1, 2019 email.

d) Hoosier Hills previously rented 18’ x 70’ single berth open slips at the $4,550 rate approved by the Commission for a 20’ x 75’ slip. Administrative Cause Number 16-167P. Again, Polen discounted the $4,550 rate to $4,200 to correlate with the smaller size. Hoosier Hills is now seeking an increase of 2% in that discounted rate for a new rate of $4,284. Polen April 1, 2019 email.

e) Polen observed that a typographical error resulted in a slip sized 16’ x 80’ being identified on the rate list attached to the Petition. Polen confirmed that Hoosier Hills does not have a slip of this size. Id.

f) Hoosier Hills’ Petition identified an 18’ x 80’ double berth, open slip with a current rental rate of $3,600. A review of Commission records revealed that the last Commission approved rate for a double berth open slip of this size was $3,000 in 2003. Administrative Cause Number 03-072P. Upon inquiry by the Hearing Officer, Polen advised; “From the point I took over the Marina the rate has been $3,600 and the prior rate I believe was $3250 before that but, I don’t know how long.” Polen April 5, 2019 email. By all indications the previous operator of Hoosier Hills increased the rate for this size slip without Commission approval. The Petition seeks to increase the rate for this size slip by 2% above the currently charged rate, which would set the rate at $3,672.

The Hearing Officer appreciates Polen’s effort to more specifically identify the slip sizes available at Hoosier Hills. While Jensen recognizes that the Commission has not formally approved a rate for an 18’ x 80’ single berth open slip or an 18’ x 70’ single berth open slip, Polen’s action to discount the Commission’s approved rate to more appropriately correlate with the actual slip size is applauded. Under these peculiar circumstances, the fact that Polen now seeks the Commission’s approval of an increase from the discounted rate that was not previously approved by the Commission is

3 By all indications the previous operator of Hoosier Hills increased the rate for this size slip without Commission approval.
comprehensible and appropriate. While the rate for the 18’ x 80’ double berth open slip was increased in the past without Commission approval, it appears that fault for that action cannot be attributed to Polen. Neither the current rate of $3,600, nor the proposed, increased rate of $3,672 is outside fair market rates.

In his April 1, 2019 email Polen clarified that Hoosier Hills is not seeking to increase the rates for the 22’x100’ single berth slip or slips referred to as “Section 8” slips that were approved by the Commission in 2018. *Administrative Cause Number 17-128P*. Hoosier Hills is also not seeking to increase the rates approved in 2017, associated with Personal Watercraft, Daily Slip Rate, Daily Slip Rate with Electricity, Daily Slip Rate for Existing Customers, and Auxiliary Boat Mooring. *Administrative Cause Number 16-167P: Polen April 1, 2019 email*.

As was noted by Stewart, the increases sought by Hoosier Hills range from 1.5% to 2.0% and average 1.82%. A comparison of the proposed rate establishment for the 20’ x 80’ single berth extended open slips and the increased rates proposed by Polen for various other slip sizes actually remain below most of the comparable marina’s rates for similarly sized slips.

It is the recommendation of the Hearing Officer that a rate of $5,300 be established for slips sized 20’ x 80’ extended. The Hearing Officer recommends further that the rate increases as proposed by Polen, in Hoosier Hills’ Petition, be approved.

After the Hearing Officer presents findings and recommendations to the Commission, the Commission may recommend approval or disapproval of the requested rate or recommend a rate in an amount less than the rate requested by the lessee. The Commission’s “recommendation for favorable consideration of a rate establishment or increase shall not be withheld unless, in the opinion of the Commission, the rates proposed exceed the fair market rates charged by operators of other similar privately-owned resort developments comparable to the project in the area.” *IB #20, Section 5*.

With the foregoing analysis, the Hearing Officer presents Exhibit C, as the proposed findings and recommendations of the Commission to the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers.
Dated: April 8, 2019

Sandra L. Jensen
Hearing Officer
Exhibit A

Division of State Parks
Department of Natural Resources
Indiana Government Center South
402 West Washington Street, Room W298
Indianapolis, IN 46204

Jennifer,

Per Information Bulletin #20 (Fifth Amendment) May 24, 2107; this is my request for Rate Increases to become effective for the 2020 Season (1/1/2020). The rate proposal is 1.5% to 2% across nearly all slips and permanent rate establishment for the 20x80 extended slip at $5300 which was approved as an interim rate by the DNR.

The rationale for the rate increase includes the CPI running at 2.5% for 2018 which impacts the costs for maintenance, staff, supplies etc. In addition for metal supplies, extrusions and other construction type materials; recent tariffs and/or discussion of tariffs have pushed certain materials above the 2.5% increase. We have continued to invest in maintenance and growth simultaneously while also experiencing higher expectations from our customer base. We have also seen significant increases in insurance costs as other marinas have experienced storm damage both summer and winter.

We have continued to invest significantly in the marina with over $1M of investment that last 24 months. Not only new docks but, we have repaired over 10 broken anchor cables, built a new service and storage shop, improved traffic flow and esthetics around the marina, installed a new code compliant propane fill station and a significant amount of money on dock repairs throughout the marina.

It is important to point out that our covered docks are all concrete and at a level above most of the comparators. Our open slips including our Houseboat slips are modern structures but, with significant age that requires high levels of maintenance. The condition of these docks would also be equivalent to the comparators for like docks.

The proposed rates are listed in an Addendum and represents 261 of our 267 slips.

Amenities Recap:
Dockside water; including winter water for the Houseboat Slips
Shorepower
Close loading and unloading zone (we have an advantage over all the comparators for access)
Restroom facilities including showers; maintained throughout the winter
Paved parking lot
24 hour closed circuit video/security system (we are equal to or advantaged over all the comparators with our new state of the art system that covers the marina area)
Store/Service/Dealer convenience (Kent's Harbor has the smallest store but, they leverage a sales/service site separate from the Marina. We have more offerings available in our Marina and also offer sales/service for pontoon boats, outboard motors, generators etc. Our store compares well with our offerings to the other marinas)
Pump-out availability at the slip for Houseboats and Gas Dock for others
Propane refill station
WIFI - Guest Network available at the Marina Deck
Laundry- Open throughout the winter
Restaurant- with expanding menu
Ramp access (Equivalent to Conley's but, advantaged over Kent's)
Hydro-hoist Dealer with Certified Installer
Westerbeke Generator Dealer with Certified Technician
Obrien Watersports Dealer
2018 we experimented with concierge services and will expand this in 2019

Summary of amenities: we have advantages in some areas and have resolved the larger gaps. We do plan to add lodging in the future which will further align Hoosier Hills Marina with some of the larger comparators. The Idle Zone Restaurant also has expanded the menu including breakfast sandwiches in 2018.

Pricing Analysis:
Slip rates incorporate many features: Location, facilities, dock construction, size, covered or uncovered, shorepower, water, pumpout availability etc. Rates do not follow a linear path for length as they tend to stairstep up due to the structure required for larger slips and higher loads for the electric service. Covered slips cost significantly more to install than open slips and rates tend to be more than 2x the rate of an open slip.

All of our docks have encapsulated flotation. All of our covered docks have concrete walkways and our open docks have wood decking. The wood decking does require significantly more maintenance.

We have installed the first in Indiana (to our knowledge) Ground Fault Protected Dock when we built our new D-Dock. This reduces the risk of an electrical shock danger around this dock and puts Hoosier Hills Marina in a Premium Segment for dock technology.

I have attached an updated spreadsheet summary including the new comparators listed in this letter.

Closing:
The past two rate increases were primarily to bring our slip rates to a competitive and sustainable level. This increase is to keep our rates as close to inflation as possible to enable continued investment in the facility.
**AGENDA ITEM #7**

Please contact me for any questions.

Emailed:

Victor Polen  
Hoosier Hills Marina  
10306 East Lick Fork Marina Road  
Celestine, IN 47521  
812-678-3313

cc: Terry Coleman  
Melissa Stewart

---

**Rate Table: First column are 2018/2019 rates**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rate Description</th>
<th>Bath</th>
<th>Proposed</th>
<th>Canalage</th>
<th>Length</th>
<th>Fuel</th>
<th>Pass Lake</th>
<th>Power Wedge</th>
<th>Keel Harbor</th>
<th>Skip Mattress</th>
<th>Mooring Yacht</th>
<th>IC State Dept</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>22 x 10 Single Berth</td>
<td>$9,200.00</td>
<td>5600</td>
<td>5400</td>
<td>7250</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 x 8 Single Extended</td>
<td>$8,800.00</td>
<td>5600</td>
<td>5400</td>
<td>7250</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 x 6 Single Berth</td>
<td>$4,600.00</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>7400</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 x 8 Single Berth</td>
<td>$4,800.00</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>7400</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 x 6 Single Berth</td>
<td>$4,100.00</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>7400</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 x 6 Single Extended</td>
<td>$4,500.00</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>7400</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 x 10 Single Berth</td>
<td>$4,000.00</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>7400</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 x 10 Single Extended</td>
<td>$4,200.00</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>7400</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 x 10 Single Berth</td>
<td>$3,600.00</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>7400</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 x 10 Single Extended</td>
<td>$3,800.00</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>7400</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 x 12 Double Berth</td>
<td>$3,900.00</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>7400</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 x 12 Double Berth</td>
<td>$4,500.00</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>7400</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 x 12 Double Extended</td>
<td>$4,700.00</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>7400</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 x 12 Double Berth</td>
<td>$4,200.00</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>7400</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 x 12 Double Extended</td>
<td>$4,800.00</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>7400</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 x 12 Double Berth</td>
<td>$4,300.00</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>7400</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 x 12 Double Extended</td>
<td>$4,900.00</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>4600</td>
<td>7400</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Legend:**
- **Double Berth**: Berth is available for two boats.
- **Single Extended**: Extended rate for single boat.
- **Double Extended**: Extended rate for double boat.
- **Pass Lake**: Price includes Pass Lake access.
- **Power Wedge**: Additional fee for power wedge.
- **Keel Harbor**: Additional fee for Keel Harbor.
- **Skip Mattress**: Additional fee for skip mattress.
- **Mooring Yacht**: Additional fee for mooring yacht.
- **IC State Dept**: IC State Department fee.

**Note:** All prices are in USD. Prices are subject to change without notice.
March 14, 2019

Sandra Jensen
Chief Administrative Law Judge
National Resources Commission
Division of Hearings
Indiana Government Center-North, Room N103
100 North Senate Avenue
Indianapolis, IN 46204

Sandra,

The Department of Natural Resources through the Division of State Parks has conducted a rate comparison for Hoosier Hills Marina as directed by the Natural Resources Commission’s Bulletin #20. The purpose of this comparison is to compare rates charged by other marinas to determine if the rate increase is justified.

The most recent rate increase for Hoosier Hills Marina was submitted and approved in 2017 and implemented in the 2018 season. At this time Hoosier Hills Marina is charging rates that are within the average range of other marinas with similar amenities in the area. They are requesting increases across their docks ranging from 1.5% to 2.0% and averaging 1.82%. They are also requesting the establishment of a new permanent rate for a 20’X80’ extended slip that previously was granted an interim rate by the Division. Hoosier Hills offers rental dock slips, rental boats, a small restaurant, marina store, fuel, seasonal trailer storage and boat sales. They are also in the process of expanding their docks and facilities and continuing to upgrade their services for their guests.

I inspected the docks at Hoosier Hills Marina multiple times during the 2018 season and most recently on March 13th, 2019 and found the docks to be in fair to good condition. Although we have received complaints from guests, it is our understanding that these are normal complaints that can be expected with raising fees. All safety issues that I found onsite were addressed and fixed in a timely manner and the docks, while old are in good condition.

The rates of a number of marinas with comparable amenities within a 400 mile distance from Hoosier Hills were used as a comparison for their proposed rates. I found the rates supplied to be accurate and the marinas to be similar enough in amenities to be justified as comparisons.

After reviewing the comparables and taking all information into account, it is the recommendation of the Division of State Parks that Hoosier Hills Marina be granted their requested increases as they were found to be reasonable and justified.

Thank you,
Melissa Stewart
Exhibit C

BEFORE THE
NATURAL RESOURCES COMMISSION
OF THE
STATE OF INDIANA

IN THE MATTER OF: )
) ADMINISTRATIVE CAUSE
PETITION FOR RATE INCREASE ) NUMBER: 18-130P
BY HOOSIER HILLS MARINA, INC.

PROPOSED
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE U.S. ARMY CORPS OF ENGINEERS
BY THE NATURAL RESOURCES COMMISSION

A. Proposed Findings

1. The scope of the informal review accorded by the Natural Resources Commission (the “Commission”) in Information Bulletin #20 (Fifth Amendment) (IB #20) is addressed to petitions for rate increase or rate establishment at marinas and related facilities on properties owned or leased by the Department of Natural Resources (the “Department”).

2. Although the Department may appropriately exercise whatever rights are provided in a ground lease with respect to marina facilities, as well as any other rights provided by law or equity, the scope of review provided in IB #20 is limited to the subject of the petition for rate increase. The Commission ultimately recommends action on the petition to the U. S. Army Corps of Engineers (“Corps”), and the Corps may either accept or reject the recommendation.

3. For requests for rate increase seeking rate establishments, the Hearing Officer shall make a written report to the Commission. The report shall include written findings with respect to the requested rate establishment or increase and a proposal to the Commission for recommendations to the Corps in determining Hoosier Hills Marina’s (“Hoosier Hills”) request.

4. Hoosier Hills, in its Petition, requests slip rate increases from 1.5% to 2.0% with an average of 1.82%.

5. In determining whether to recommend a rate increase be granted the Department is to analyze similar facilities and compare rates with those sought by the Petitioner. The consideration of rates charged by comparable marinas is fundamental to determining the propriety of proposed rate increases to marina slips and mooring buoys. The preponderance of information in the record indicates that the increased slip rates proposed by Hoosier Hills will remain consistently below the slip rates charged by comparable marinas for similarly sized slips.
6. A Hearing Officer’s or the Commission’s recommendation for rate increase shall not be withheld unless the rates proposed exceed the fair market rates charged by operators of other similar privately-owned resort developments comparable to the project in the area.

7. The Commission exercises its authority to recommend the establishment of a $5,300 rate for single berth, open slips sized 20’ x 80’ for which the Department previously approved an interim rate.

8. Further, the Commission exercises its authority to recommend approval of the rate increases as requested by Hoosier Hills.

9. The requested rate establishment and increases, are within the industry range and supportable. The rates approved by the Commission are set forth in the attached table, which includes all rates previously established as well as the rates recommended for approval through this action. Rates established through previous Commission recommendations are so noted.

B. Proposed Recommendation

The Natural Resources Commission recommends to the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers the rates as set forth in the attached table be approved for existing facilities at Hoosier Hills Marina.

Dated: ________________

Bryan Poynter, Chair
Natural Resources Commission
Commission Slip Rate Recommendation

## COMPREHENSIVE RATE LIST

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HOOISER HILLS MARINA SLIP SIZE &amp; DESCRIPTION</th>
<th>CURRENT RATE</th>
<th>COMMISSION RATE RECOMMENDATION for IMPLEMENTATION JANUARY 1, 2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>22’ x 100’ single berth, open</td>
<td>$6,400.00</td>
<td>$6,400.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22’ x 80’ single berth, open</td>
<td>$5,300.00</td>
<td>$5,406.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20’ x 80’ single berth, extended, open</td>
<td>$5,300.00</td>
<td>$5,300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20’ x 80’ single berth, open</td>
<td>$4,850.00</td>
<td>$4,947.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20’ x 75’ single berth</td>
<td>Obsolete</td>
<td>Obsolete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20’ x 70’ single berth, extended, open</td>
<td>$4,550.00</td>
<td>$4,641.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18’ x 80’ single berth, open</td>
<td>$4,600.00</td>
<td>$4,692.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18’ x 70’ single berth, open</td>
<td>$4,000.00</td>
<td>$4,080.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18’ x 70’ single berth extended, open</td>
<td>$4,200.00</td>
<td>$4,284.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16’ x 60’ single berth</td>
<td>$3,750.00</td>
<td>$3,824.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18’ x 80’ double berth, open</td>
<td>$3,600.00</td>
<td>$3,672.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14’ x 36’ single berth, covered</td>
<td>$3,600.00</td>
<td>$3,654.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18’ x 70’ double berth, open</td>
<td>$3,400.00</td>
<td>$3,468.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18’ x 60’ double berth, open</td>
<td>$3,040.00</td>
<td>$3,100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18’ x 50’ double berth, open</td>
<td>$2,800.00</td>
<td>$2,856.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16’ x 50’ double berth</td>
<td>Obsolete</td>
<td>Obsolete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16’ x 45’ double berth, open</td>
<td>$2,500.00</td>
<td>$2,550.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14’ x 30’ single berth, covered</td>
<td>$3,000.00</td>
<td>$3,045.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12’ x 30’, single berth, covered</td>
<td>$2,900.00</td>
<td>$2,944.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10’ x 30’ single berth, (narrow covered)</td>
<td>$2,600.00</td>
<td>$2,639.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12’ x 24’ single berth, covered</td>
<td>$2,400.00</td>
<td>$2,436.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16’ x 36’ double berth, open</td>
<td>$2,000.00</td>
<td>$2,030.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14’ x 36’ double berth, open</td>
<td>$1,800.00</td>
<td>$1,827.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30’ double berth or end slip, open</td>
<td>$1,500.00</td>
<td>$1,523.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24’ double berth or end slip, open</td>
<td>$1,150.00</td>
<td>$1,168.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Watercraft, open**</td>
<td>$300.00</td>
<td>$300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Description</td>
<td>New Rate</td>
<td>Old Rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily Slip, double berth, open**</td>
<td>$30.00</td>
<td>$25.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily Slip w/ Electricity, double berth, open**</td>
<td>$35.00</td>
<td>$35.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auxiliary Boat Mooring**</td>
<td>$40.00</td>
<td>$40.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily Slip Rental – existing dock customers**</td>
<td>$10.00</td>
<td>$10.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 8 Slips, double berth, open*</td>
<td>$500.00</td>
<td>$500.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Rate approved in 2018 (implemented 2019); Administrative Cause Number 17-128P

**Rate approved in 2018 (implementation 2018); Administrative Cause Number 16-167P