2016 Residential Bill Survey

Rate Jurisdictional Electric Utilities

July 1, 2016 Billing

Commission Staff presents a survey of Indiana regulated electric utility billings for residential customers annually. The survey presents rates at a snapshot in time, namely July 1st of each year. The surveyed providers to these customers include 5 investorowned and 9 municipal utilities¹.

We present the results in various ways to improve the transparency of the data collected. All rates included in this survey are approved by the Commission and applicable on customer bills issued July 1. The initial tables show the July 1, 2016 bill applicable to simple tariff residential customers at 500, 1000, 1500, and 2000 kWh monthly consumption levels first alphabetically and then ranked by 1000 kWh cost, highest being 1st. Next, we present the year over year change to the customer bills at 1000 kWh.

The survey includes all rate trackers, but excludes taxes. Expense and capital trackers provide a means to include cost changes in customer rates outside of a traditional rate case. The fuel and power cost tracker for each municipal in 2016 is compared to 2015 in Table 4. The investor-owned group employs a variety of tracking mechanisms for which the 2016 and 2015 charges are listed for comparison. Table 6 is included to disaggregate the base rate and tracker cost components of 1000 kWh consumption for each of the investor-owned electric utilities. Table 7 and Figure 1 present the electric utilities 1000 kWh residential customer bills for a 10-year historical period.

Table/Figure List

Table 1	Jurisdictional Electric Utility Residential Customer Bill Survey: By Type and Utility Name Alphabetically
Table 2	Jurisdictional Electric Utility Residential Customer Bills: Ranking @ 1000 kWh
Table 3	Jurisdictional Electric Utility Residential Customer Bill: 2016 vs. 2015 Comparison
Table 4	Jurisdictional Municipal Electric Utility Residential Customer Bills: Fuel/Power Cost Tracker 2016 vs. 2015 Comparison
Table 5	Investor-owned Electric Utility Residential Customer Bills: Rate Tracker 2016 vs. 2015 Comparison
Table 6	Investor-owned Electric Utility Residential Customer Bills: Base and Variable Cost Components
Table 7	10-year Residential Bill Change (2006 to 2016)
Figure 1	Electric Utility Residential Customer Bills: 1000 kWh Consumption (2006-2016)

¹ We note that 67 municipal and 42 co-operative electricity providers within the state are excluded as non-jurisdictional.

Revised on July 20, 2016 to correct NIPSCO FAC input.

Table 1

JURISDICTIONAL ELECTRIC UTILITY RESIDENTIAL CUSTOMER BILL SURVEY [July 1, 2016 Billing] By Utility Name and Type

	kWh Consumption								
MUNICIPAL UTILITIES		500		1000		1500		2000	Overall Ranking*
Anderson Municipal	\$	67.04	\$	114.38	\$	161.71	\$	209.04	6
Auburn Municipal		42.65		78.30		113.96		149.61	14
Crawfordsville Municipal		60.49		105.98		151.47		196.96	9
Frankfort Municipal		55.53		100.77		146.02		186.98	12
Kingsford Heights Municipal		50.67		97.84		145.01		192.18	13
Knightstown Municipal		59.85		114.84		165.27		215.70	4
Lebanon Municipal		62.14		114.51		163.07		211.64	5
Richmond Municipal		60.67		105.81		150.94		194.34	10
Tipton Municipal		54.87		103.75		150.33		196.92	11
INVESTOR OWNED UTILITIES									
Duke Energy Indiana	\$	67.95	\$	114.84	\$	156.92	\$	198.97	3
Indiana Michigan Power D/B/A AEP		60.18		113.05		165.93		218.80	7
Indianapolis Power & Light Co.		67.44		107.42		147.39		187.37	8
Northern Indiana Public Service Co.		66.43		121.86		177.29		232.73	2
So. Indiana Gas & Electric Co. D/B/A Vectren		83.01		155.03		227.04		299.06	1

*Overall Ranking (highest to lowest) based on Total Rate at 1000 kWh consumption

Table 2

JURISDICTIONAL ELECTRIC UTILITY RESIDENTIAL CUSTOMER BILLS

[July 1, 2016 Billing]

Overall Ranking for 1,000 kWh of Consumption

		500		1000		1500		2000	
NAME	kWh			kWh		kWh		kWh	
1 So. Indiana Gas & Electric Co. D/B/A Vectren	\$	83.01	\$	155.03	\$	227.04	\$	299.06	
2 Northern Indiana Public Service Co.	\$	66.43	\$	121.86	\$	177.29	\$	232.73	
3 Duke Energy Indiana	\$	67.95	\$	114.84	\$	156.92	\$	198.97	
4 Knightstown Municipal	\$	59.85	\$	114.84	\$	165.27	\$	215.70	
5 Lebanon Municipal	\$	62.14	\$	114.51	\$	163.07	\$	211.64	
6 Anderson Municipal	\$	67.04	\$	114.38	\$	161.71	\$	209.04	
7 Indiana Michigan Power D/B/A AEP	\$	60.18	\$	113.05	\$	165.93	\$	218.80	
8 Indianapolis Power & Light Co.	\$	67.44	\$	107.42	\$	147.39	\$	187.37	
9 Crawfordsville Municipal	\$	60.49	\$	105.98	\$	151.47	\$	196.96	
10 Richmond Municipal	\$	60.67	\$	105.81	\$	150.94	\$	194.34	
11 Tipton Municipal	\$	54.87	\$	103.75	\$	150.33	\$	196.92	
12 Frankfort Municipal	\$	55.53	\$	100.77	\$	146.02	\$	186.98	
13 Kingsford Heights Municipal	\$	50.67	\$	97.84	\$	145.01	\$	192.18	
14 Auburn Municipal	\$	42.65	\$	78.30	\$	113.96	\$	149.61	
Average	\$	61.35		\$110.60		\$158.74		\$206.45	
2015 Survey	\$	60.68		\$109.61		\$157.43		\$204.82	
% Change		1.11%		0.90%		0.83%		0.80%	

Table 3

Jurisdictional Electric Utility Residential Customer Bill 1000 kWh Usage, July 1 Billing (By Name) Year to Year Comparison

MUNICIPAL UTILITIES			2016	2015	% Change
Anderson Municipal		\$	114.38	\$ 114.65	-0.2%
Auburn Municipal		\$	78.30	\$ 78.30	0.0%
Crawfordsville Municipal		\$	105.98	\$ 105.98	0.0%
Frankfort Municipal		\$	100.77	\$ 96.28	4.7%
Kingsford Heights Municipal		\$	97.84	\$ 108.79	-10.1%
Knightstown Municipal		\$	114.84	\$ 113.62	1.1%
Lebanon Municipal		\$	114.51	\$ 111.67	2.5%
Richmond Municipal		\$	105.81	\$ 106.19	-0.4%
Tipton Municipal		\$	103.75	\$ 101.80	1.9%
	Muni Averages	-	104.02	104.14	-0.1%

INVESTOR OWNED UTILITIES

		IOU Averages	1	22.44	1	119.44	2.5%
	So. Indiana Gas & Electric Co. D/B/A Vectren		\$	155.03	\$	153.23	1.2%
	Northern Indiana Public Service Co.		\$	121.86	\$	125.48	-2.9%
*	Indianapolis Power & Light Co.		\$	107.42	\$	95.37	12.6%
	Indiana Michigan Power D/B/A AEP		\$	113.05	\$	109.10	3.6%
	Duke Energy Indiana		\$	114.84	\$	114.04	0.7%

^{*} Implemented new base rates in the past year.

Table 4

Jurisdictional Municipal Electric Utility Residential Customer Bill 1000 kWh Usage, July 1 Billing (By Name) Year to Year Comparison Fuel/Power Factor Adjustment Mechanism

Fuel/Power Factor Charge @ 1000 kWh	2016	2015	Change
	\$	\$	\$
Anderson Municipal	10.39	10.67	(0.28)
Auburn Municipal	0.00	0.00	0.00
Crawfordsville Municipal	14.91	14.91	0.00
Frankfort Municipal	44.41	39.92	4.50
Kingsford Heights Municipal	30.44	41.39	(10.96)
Knightstown Municipal	11.47	10.25	1.22
Lebanon Municipal	14.04	11.20	2.84
Richmond Municipal	41.18	41.56	(0.38)
Tipton Municipal	38.11	36.16	1.95

^{*} Implemented new base rates in the past year.

Indiana Investor-Owned Electric Utilities Year to Year Comparison Adjustable Rate Mechanisms on Residential Bills 1000 kWh Usage, July 1 Billing

1000 KVII OSugo,		2016	2015	Change
		\$	\$	\$
Indiana Michigan Power D/B/A AEP		Ψ	Ψ	Ψ
FAC		(1.43)	(1.50)	0.07
DSM		4.74	4.74	0.00
Off-System Sales Sharing		(0.60)	(2.21)	1.61
RTO		6.93	6.73	0.20
EA		(0.01)	0.73	(0.10)
QPCP & QPCP O&M		2.57	1.24	1.33
Capacity Settlement		2.62	3.52	(0.90)
Depreiation Credit		(1.24)	(1.24)	0.00
LCM		5.83	4.09	1.74
LCM	Total	19.41	15.46	3.95
	Total	19.41	15.46	3.95
Indianapolis Power & Light Co.		(2.00)	10 = 0	(=0 ==)
FAC		(2.00)	18.73	(20.73)
QPCP & QPCP O&M		8.43	9.27	(0.84)
DSM		3.57	0.88	2.69
	Total	10.00	28.87	(18.87)
Northern Indiana Public Service Co.				
FAC		(3.98)	0.56	(4.54)
QPCP		6.02	5.79	0.22
QPCP O&M		3.08	2.35	0.73
RTO		1.38	0.62	0.76
Resource Adequacy		2.67	2.69	(0.02)
Cyber Security		0.14	0.14	0.00
DSM		4.82	4.49	0.32
TDSIC		(0.18)	0.00	(0.18)
	Total	13.94	16.64	(2.71)
Duke Energy Indiana				
FAC		11.21	14.19	(2.98)
QPCP		3.74	3.42	0.32
QPCP O&M		5.86	3.90	1.96
EA		(0.04)	0.08	(0.12)
DSM		3.88	3.24	0.64
RTO		2.16	1.42	0.74
IGCC		12.67	12.67	0.00
Summer Relability		0.69	0.45	0.24
Cyber Security		0.06	0.00	0.06
Amortization Phase Out		(0.59)	(0.53)	(0.06)
Amortization I hase out	Total	39.64	38.84	0.80
	1 Otal	37.04	30.04	0.00
So. Indiana Gas & Electric Co. D/B/A Vectren				
FAC		(8.44)	(8.05)	(0.39)
RTO		4.55	3.31	1.23
-				
Reliability (RCRA)		(0.36)	(1.27)	0.91
DSM	TT + 1	7.85	7.48	0.37
	Total	3.59	1.47	2.12

FAC = Fuel Adjustment Charge

QPCP = Qualified Pollution Control Property

DSM = Demand Side Management

QPCP O&M = Qualified Polltion Control Property Operation & Maintenance

EA = Emission Allowance

IGCC = Clean Coal Tracker for Gasification Plant

RTO = Midwest ISO or PJM ISO Non-fuel

LCM = Nuclear Life Cycle Management

TDSIC = Transmission, Distribution and Storage Investment

^{*} Implemented new base rates in the past year. IPL's new Trackers for Resource Adequacy, Off-System Sales Sharing, and RTO are set at zero and therefore not reflected in the comparison table.

Table 6

Indiana Investor-Owned Electric Utilities Base and Variable (Tracker) Bill Components 1000 kWh Usage, July 1, 2016 Billing

	Base	Variable	Total	Base Rate Case Year
	\$	\$	\$	
Indiana Michigan Power D/B/A AEP	93.64	19.41	113.05	2013
Indianapolis Power & Light Co.	97.42	10.00	107.42	2016
Northern Indiana Public Service Co.	107.93	13.94	121.86	2011
Duke Energy Indiana	75.20	39.64	114.84	2004
So. Indiana Gas & Electric Co. D/B/A Vectren	151.44	3.59	155.03	2011

Table 7

10-year Residential Bill Change

(RS Bill for 1000 kWh usage, 7/1 of each year)

	2006	2016	Cha	ange	%Change
Knightstown Municipal	\$ 66.22	\$ 114.84	\$	48.62	73%
Auburn Municipal	\$ 46.38	\$ 78.30	\$	31.92	69%
I&M	\$ 69.26	\$ 113.05	\$	43.79	63%
SIGECO	\$ 95.25	\$ 155.03	\$	59.78	63%
Lebanon Municipal	\$ 72.76	\$ 114.51	\$	41.75	57%
Anderson Municipal	\$ 77.00	\$ 114.38	\$	37.38	49%
Frankfort Municipal	\$ 70.84	\$ 100.77	\$	29.93	42%
Crawfordsville Municipal	\$ 75.75	\$ 105.98	\$	30.23	40%
Tipton Municipal	\$ 75.48	\$ 103.75	\$	28.27	37%
IP&L	\$ 78.91	\$ 107.42	\$	28.51	36%
Richmond Municipal	\$ 81.45	\$ 105.81	\$	24.36	30%
DEI	\$ 89.73	\$ 114.84	\$	25.11	28%
NIPSCO	\$ 106.35	\$ 121.86	\$	15.51	15%
Kingsford Heights Municipal	\$ 85.42	\$ 97.84	\$	12.42	15%

