

Appendix A

Evaluation Criteria Scoring Details

Grouping and Scoring Approach

A. Project Grouping

- a. Projects will be scored against like projects based on carve-outs, not directly against different sectors. For example:
 - i. Electric school buses vs. electric school buses (as carved out)
 - ii. School buses (non-electric) vs. School buses (non-electric) – (as carved out)
 - iii. Onroad (except school buses) equipment/vehicles vs. Onroad (except school buses) equipment/vehicles
 - iv. Nonroad equipment/vehicles vs. Nonroad equipment/vehicles

B. Project Scoring Approach

- a. **Cost effectiveness of project (\$ per ton of NOx reduced) – 25 Points**
 - i. Calculated using U.S. EPA’s Diesel Emission Quantifier (DEQ)
 - ii. Applicant will be provided a template and required to submit the detailed information necessary for a DEQ run (i.e. existing equipment/vehicle tier/model year, replacement equipment/vehicle tier/model year, fuel consumption, miles driven, hours of operation, etc.)
 - iii. Fleet specific data from the applicant used with maximum levels set at DEQ defaults for gallons of fuel used, annual miles driven, annual idling hours, and remaining useful life
 - iv. Each group (as described above) scored against each other based on DEQ “Lifetime Cost Effectiveness (\$/short ton reduced) with highest point amount (25) being based on project with lowest cost per short ton reduced.
 1. 25 points – 80% - 100% of most cost-effective project
 2. 20 points – 60% - 79% of most cost-effective project
 3. 15 points – 40% - 59% of most cost-effective project
 4. 10 points – 20% - 39% of most cost-effective project
 5. 5 points – 10% - 19% of most cost-effective project
 6. 0 points – 9% or lower of most cost-effective project
- b. **Project’s total NOx emission reduction potential (based on type of project and/or the use of vehicle) – 15 Points**
 - i. Calculated using U.S. EPA’s Diesel Emission Quantifier (DEQ)

- ii. Applicant will be provided and required to submit the detailed information necessary for a DEQ run
- iii. Fleet specific data from the applicant used with maximum levels set at DEQ defaults for gallons of fuel used, annual miles driven, annual idling hours, and remaining useful life
- iv. Each group (as described above) scored against each other based on DEQ “Lifetime Results (short ton reduced) with highest point amount (15) being based on project with highest lifetime short ton reduction and lowest point amount (0) being based on project with lowest lifetime short ton reduction.
 - 1. 15 points – 80% - 100% of highest reduction project
 - 2. 12 points – 60% - 79% of highest reduction project
 - 3. 9 points – 40% - 59% of highest reduction project
 - 4. 6 points – 20% - 39% of highest reduction project
 - 5. 3 points – 10% -19% of highest reduction project
 - 6. 0 points – 9% or below the highest reduction project

c. NAAQS sensitive areas as a percentage of current standards – 15 Points

- i. Using most recent IDEM calculated 3-year design values
 - 1. 15 points – Located in an area designated as nonattainment for Ozone or PM2.5 or area measuring above current standard
 - 2. 10 points – within 95% of current Ozone or PM2.5 standard
 - 3. 8 points – within 90% of current Ozone or PM2.5 standard
 - 4. 6 points – within 85% of current Ozone or PM2.5 standard
 - 5. 4 points – within 80% of current Ozone or PM2.5 standard
 - 6. 2 points – within 75% of current Ozone or PM2.5 standard
 - 7. 0 points – below 75% of current Ozone or PM2.5 standard

d. Air quality benefits to areas with sensitive populations or that bear a disproportionate share of the air pollution burden – 10 Points

- i. Each county within the state is assigned a value from two (2) to zero (0) based on the following:
 - 1. Scoring criteria
 - a. 2 points – above statewide average in index category
 - b. 1 point – +/- 5% of statewide average in index category
 - c. 0 points – below statewide average in index category
 - 2. Index categories for each county
 - a. poverty level

- b. total onroad NOx emissions
 - c. National Air Toxics Assessment (NATA) diesel PM level
 - d. percent of children (14 and younger) and elderly (65 and older) population
 - e. minority population
- e. **Transformational potential (potential to prove or maximize effectiveness of newer technology) – 15 Points**
 - i. Lasting effect
 - 1. 15 points – proposals that notably change standard operating practices as part of a long term vision through transition to a new fuel infrastructure that did not exist for that entity previously
 - 2. 10 points – proposals that uniquely address current use of equipment/vehicles regardless of fuel type that have quantifiable emission reduction potential to improve air quality in the area
 - 3. 5 points – proposals that continue the transition to a new fuel infrastructure or more environmentally beneficial standard operating practices
 - 4. 0 points – proposals that are replacing existing diesel-powered equipment/vehicles with like-kind and purposed new diesel-powered equipment/vehicles
- f. **Leveraging of resources (financial only) – 10 Points**
 - i. Using minimum required applicant match as 0-point starting level
 - 1. 10 points – 75% more than required match
 - 2. 8 points – 50% more than required match
 - 3. 6 points – 25% more than required match
 - 4. 4 points – 10% more than required match
 - 5. 2 points – 5% more than required match
 - 6. 0 points – only required match
- g. **Business, governmental, and not-for-profit entities registered with the Indiana Secretary of State that operate vehicles and equipment in conjunction with Indiana facilities (include Indiana Economic Impact documentation)– 5 Points**
 - i. Using Indiana Secretary of State Business Services Division information for reference
 - 1. 5 points – Applicant registered as Indiana business with main/corporate offices within the State of Indiana

2. 3 points – Applicant registered as Indiana business with main/corporate offices outside of Indiana
3. 0 points – Applicant not registered as Indiana business

h. Active participant in the State of Indiana Department of Administration or Department of Transportation Minority/Women/Veterans Business Enterprise Participation Plan (include MBE/WBE/VBE documentation) or in the case of a nonprofit or local unit of government has published guidelines that support MBE/WBE/VBE participation.– 5 Points

- i. Using Indiana Department of Administration and/or Indiana Department of Transportation for reference
 1. 5 points – Applicant is MBE/WBE/VBE participant
 2. 3 points – Applicant using contractor that is MBE/WBE/VBE participant
 3. 0 points – No certification of applicant or contractor

Reference for RFP (Appendix A) Scoring

1) NAAQS Scoring

- Clark, Floyd, Marion, Lake, Porter, St. Joseph, LaPorte (Michigan City monitor – 2 yrs of data) – 15 pts for nonattainment areas or areas measuring above the current standard
- Ozone controlling factor in assigning points over annual PM2.5 standard. No areas within 75% of the 24-hour PM2.5 standard at 35.0 ug/m3.
- All counties assigned 15, 10, or 8 points
- Monitored 3 year ozone design value assigned points as follows:
 - Nonattainment area or area that measures above 0.070 ppm – 15 pts
 - 0.067 – 0.070 ppm – 10 pts
 - 0.063 – 0.066 ppm – 8 pts
 - 0.060 – 0.062 ppm – 6 pts
 - 0.056 – 0.059 ppm - 4 pts
 - 0.053 – 0.055 ppm – 2 pts
 - < 0.053 ppm – 0 pts
- Areas without a monitor were assigned points using a model/statistical tool to estimate ozone concentration based on proximity to nearby monitors

2) Sensitive Population/Disproportionate Share Air Pollution Burden

- Points assigned based on comparison to the state average for each index
- Sources of information for each index:
 - Poverty: 2017 Census Data <https://www.census.gov/search->
 - Onroad NOx Emissions: 2014 NEI <https://www.epa.gov/air-emissions-inventories/2014-national-emissions-inventory-nei-data> downloaded 04/24/2019
 - National Air Toxics Assessment (NATA) diesel PM level: 2014 NATA <https://www.epa.gov/national-air-toxics-assessment/2014-nata-assessment-results> downloaded 04/24/2019
 - Children/Elderly: 2017 Census Data TABLE CC-EST2017-ALLDATA-[ST-FIPS]: Annual County Resident Population Estimates by Age, Sex, Race, and Hispanic Origin: April 1, 2010 to July 1, 2017 <https://www2.census.gov/programs-surveys/popest/datasets/2010-2017/counties/asrh/cc-est2017-alldata.csv?#>
 - Minority: 2017 Census Data TABLE PEPSR6H <https://factfinder.census.gov/faces/nav/jsf/pages/searchresults.xhtml?refresh=t>

3) Leveraging

- CNG or diesel projects with required applicant match of 75%
 - 10 pts – NA
 - 8 pts – NA
 - 6 pts – 93% or more (example, 75% * 1.25 = 93%)
 - 4 pts – 82% or more
 - 2 pts – 78% or more
- Electric projects with required applicant match of 25%

- 10 pts – 43% or more
 - 8 pts – 37% or more
 - 6 pts – 31% or more
 - 4 pts – 27% or more
 - 2 pts – 26% or more
- Drayage projects with required applicant match of 50%
 - 10 pts – 87% or more
 - 8 pts – 75% or more
 - 6 pts – 62% or more
 - 4 pts – 55% or more
 - 2 pts – 52% or more

NAAQS Scoring

County	NAAQS Score
Adams	10
Allen	10
Bartholomew	10
Benton	8
Blackford	8
Boone	10
Brown	8
Carroll	8
Cass	10
Clark	15
Clay	8
Clinton	10
Crawford	8
Daviess	10
De Kalb	10
Dearborn	8
Decatur	8
Delaware	8
Dubois	8
Elkhart	10
Fayette	8
Floyd	15
Fountain	8
Franklin	8
Fulton	10
Gibson	10
Grant	10
Greene	10
Hamilton	10
Hancock	10
Harrison	10
Hendricks	10
Henry	8
Howard	10
Huntington	8
Jackson	8
Jasper	8
Jay	8
Jefferson	8
Jennings	8
Johnson	10
Knox	10
Kosciusko	10
La Porte	15
Lagrange	8
Lake	15
Lawrence	8
Madison	10

NAAQS Scoring

Marion	15
Marshall	10
Martin	8
Miami	10
Monroe	8
Montgomery	8
Morgan	8
Newton	8
Noble	8
Ohio	8
Orange	8
Owen	8
Parke	8
Perry	8
Pike	10
Porter	15
Posey	10
Pulaski	8
Putnam	8
Randolph	8
Ripley	8
Rush	8
Scott	10
Shelby	10
Spencer	10
St Joseph	15
Starke	8
Steuben	10
Sullivan	8
Switzerland	8
Tippecanoe	8
Tipton	10
Union	8
Vanderburgh	10
Vermillion	8
Vigo	10
Wabash	10
Warren	8
Warrick	10
Washington	10
Wayne	8
Wells	8
White	8
Whitley	10

Sensitive Population and Disproportionate Burden Scoring

County Name	Poverty level score	Onroad NOx emissions score	NATA diesel PM level score	Percent of children (14 and younger) and elderly (65 and older) population score	Minority population score	Total score
Adams County	2	0	0	2	0	4
Allen County	2	2	2	1	2	9
Bartholomew County	0	2	2	1	2	7
Benton County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Blackford County	2	0	0	2	0	4
Boone County	0	2	2	1	0	5
Brown County	0	0	0	2	0	2
Carroll County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Cass County	2	0	0	1	2	5
Clark County	0	2	2	0	2	6
Clay County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Clinton County	2	0	0	2	0	4
Crawford County	2	0	0	1	0	3
Daviess County	2	0	0	2	0	4
Dearborn County	0	0	2	1	0	3
Decatur County	0	0	0	1	0	1
De Kalb County	0	0	2	1	0	3
Delaware County	2	2	2	0	2	8
Dubois County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Elkhart County	0	2	2	1	2	7
Fayette County	2	0	0	1	0	3
Floyd County	0	0	2	1	2	5
Fountain County	1	0	0	2	0	3
Franklin County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Fulton County	1	0	0	2	0	3
Gibson County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Grant County	2	2	1	1	2	8
Greene County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Hamilton County	0	2	2	1	2	7
Hancock County	0	2	2	1	0	5
Harrison County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Hendricks County	0	2	2	0	2	6
Henry County	1	2	0	1	0	4
Howard County	2	0	2	1	2	7
Huntington County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Jackson County	1	2	0	1	0	4
Jasper County	0	2	0	1	0	3
Jay County	2	0	0	2	0	4
Jefferson County	2	0	0	0	0	2
Jennings County	1	0	0	1	0	2
Johnson County	0	2	2	1	2	7
Knox County	2	0	0	1	1	4
Kosciusko County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Lagrange County	0	0	0	2	0	2
Lake County	2	2	2	1	2	9
La Porte County	2	2	2	1	2	9
Lawrence County	2	0	0	1	0	3
Madison County	2	2	2	1	2	9
Marion County	2	2	2	0	2	8
Marshall County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Martin County	1	0	0	1	0	2
Miami County	2	0	0	1	2	5
Monroe County	2	2	2	0	2	8
Montgomery County	1	0	0	1	0	2

Sensitive Population and Disproportionate Burden Scoring

County Name	Poverty level score	Onroad NOx emissions score	NATA diesel PM level score	Percent of children (14 and younger) and elderly (65 and older) population score	Minority population score	Total score
Morgan County	0	2	2	1	0	5
Newton County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Noble County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Ohio County	0	0	2	1	0	3
Orange County	2	0	0	1	0	3
Owen County	2	0	0	1	0	3
Parke County	2	0	0	1	0	3
Perry County	1	0	2	1	0	4
Pike County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Porter County	0	2	2	0	2	6
Posey County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Pulaski County	1	0	0	1	0	2
Putnam County	1	0	0	0	2	3
Randolph County	2	0	0	2	0	4
Ripley County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Rush County	1	0	0	1	0	2
St. Joseph County	2	2	2	1	2	9
Scott County	2	0	2	1	0	5
Shelby County	0	2	2	1	0	5
Spencer County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Starke County	2	0	0	1	0	3
Steuben County	0	2	0	1	0	3
Sullivan County	2	0	0	0	2	4
Switzerland County	2	0	2	1	0	5
Tippecanoe County	2	2	2	0	2	8
Tipton County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Union County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Vanderburgh County	2	2	2	1	2	9
Vermillion County	2	0	0	1	0	3
Vigo County	2	2	2	0	2	8
Wabash County	2	0	0	1	0	3
Warren County	0	0	0	1	0	1
Warrick County	0	0	1	1	1	3
Washington County	2	0	0	1	0	3
Wayne County	2	2	1	1	2	8
Wells County	0	0	0	2	0	2
White County	0	0	0	2	0	2
Whitley County	0	0	0	1	0	1