Internal HR Investigations: The Good, The Bad, The Ugly

David A. Fleischhacker Employee Relations Deputy Counsel

June 2019

46th Annual Indiana Consortium of Local and Human Rights Agencies Conference



Why is this important?

- FY 2018 EEOC Nationwide
 - 76,418 Charges
- FY 2018 EEOC Indiana
 - 1,890 Charges
- Increase in Complaints/Investigations
 - ICRC Employment Complaints (~54% increase):
 - > 2017: 324
 - > 2018:500
 - State of Indiana (Executive Branch)
 - > ~97% increase from 2017 to 2018
 - Trending higher in 2019
- Heightened Awareness
 - #MeToo and #TimesUp Movements
 - Modernization of Harassment Prevention Policies and Programming







Topics Covered

1
Agency/Organization
Policies

Reporting Pathways

Training Program

Investigation Process

5
Special Procedures

6 Retaliation Prohibition



Agency/Organization Policy and Programming

- Develop/Implement a Policy
 - Protected Status categories
 - > Race, color, creed, religion, sex, national origin, ancestry, age, sexual orientation or gender identity, physical or mental disability, and veteran status (State of Indiana Executive Branch)
 - Definitions/Descriptions
 - Process for reporting, investigating, and resolving complaints
 - Protections
 - Onboarding and annual refresher courses
- Update Policy/Programming as needed
 - Static? Outdated?
 - Modernize
 - Update protected categories
 - Train whole workforce, including executive leadership



Complaint Reporting Pathways

- Internal Reporting Structure
 - Agency AA/EEO/ADA Coordinator
 - Human Resources Staff/Director
 - Supervisor/Management
- External Reporting
 - Indiana Civil Rights Commission (ICRC)
 - Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC)



Investigation Training

Internal Training

- Formalized Training/Workshops
- Shadowing/Hands-on Experience
- Develop Guides and other Resources
 - > Tracking Programs

External Training

- Formal Comprehensive Investigation Training
 - ➤ Identify what investigation model/technique is appropriate
- SHRM/CLEs/etc.



Investigation Process

- 1. Intake
- 2. Collect Evidence
 - 1. Review documents and other evidence
 - 2. Prepare for interviews
 - 3. Conduct interviews (Complainant, Witnesses, Respondent)
 - 4. Request and collect any additional evidence
- 3. Assess Evidence
- 4. Draw Conclusions and write Investigation Report with findings and recommendations
- 5. Take Action



Investigation Intake

- 1. Informal
- 2. Formal

402 W. Washington St.,	Rm. W161 Indianapolis, Ind	diana 46204-2745 Telephone: (317) 232-0200	
(sint Intake Form State Personnel Department s	taff)	
Complainant Name				
Complainant's E-mail		Complainant's Phone Number	5	
Complainant's Agency		Complainant's Position	5	
Date Received		Received By		
☐ Phone Other	□ Email	□ Standard Mail	☐ In-Person	
Date(s) of Incident		Time(s) of Incident		
	Respondent(s)	Identified In Complaint		
Name		Position/Agency/Supervisor		
Detailed descr	ription of allegations, i	ncluding Complainant's rea	ction to incident:	

	ho witnessed the inc	uent(S), II any:		
	Additional Question	ıs		
Nature of relationship between Comp. Respondent (supervisor/subordinate,				
trangers, friends, etc.)?				
Has this kind of incident happened be Complainant? If yes, please provide d				
f incident.	-			
Has this kind of behavior been previo Respondent? If so, to whom and when				
Additional Notes:				
Additional Protess				
there attachments? Yes No [If complai uding any emails: If complaint was made plainant hands you any documents, plea	le through a call cente	t, always attach ti , ask for the reco	he document(s), rding to be save	d If
uding any emails. If complaint was mad	le through a call cente	t, always attach to , ask for the reco	he document(s), and the serven	d If



Evidence Collection

- 1. Review documents and other evidence (email, phone records, etc.)
- 2. Prepare for interviews
- 3. Conduct interviews (Complainant, Witnesses, Respondent)
 - 1. Fact-Finding Role
 - 2. Focus and limit questions to matter at hand
 - 3. Identify possible other witnesses
- 4. Request and collect any additional evidence



Evidence Assessment

- 1. What story does the evidence tell?
- 2. Are there any gaps in that story that need to be filled?
- 3. Credibility determinations
 - 1. Do witness statements match up with other evidence/facts?
 - 2. What to do in a he said/she said situation?



Final Report

Write Investigation Report with findings and recommendations:

- 1. Summarize evidence
- 2. Focus on the conduct/behavior what is substantiated?
- 3. Did the conduct violate a policy?
- 4. Does the conduct warrant adverse employment action?
 - 1. If so, what level is appropriate?
 - 2. Are other options more appropriate?
 - 3. Are there due process or other contractual considerations?
- 5. Who is the audience for the report?
- 6. Precautions



Take Action

- 1. Who takes the next step?
- 2. Follow up with Complainant
- 3. Follow up with Respondent
- 4. Implement Adverse Employment Action
- 5. Rehabilitate Workplace as needed



Special Procedures

- 1. Sexual Harassment Complaints
- 2. Third Parties
- 3. Executive Level Staff



Retaliation Prohibitions

- Retaliation for filing a complaint is prohibited
 - Agency/Organization Policy
 - Title VII and other Federal/State employment laws (ADA, ADEA, etc.)
- Retaliation for engaging in a protected activity is prohibited
 - Agency/Organization Policy
 - Title VII and other Federal/State employment laws (ADA, ADEA, etc.)



Questions?

Investigation Related Resources:

- 1. State of Indiana Policy: https://www.in.gov/spd/files/harasspol.pdf
- 2. EEOC: https://www.eeoc.gov/eeoc/publications/promising-practices.cfm
- 3. Washington State Human Rights Commission Model Policies and Best Practices: http://www.lni.wa.gov/WorkplaceRights/files/Policies/IntroductionSexualHarassmentPolicyBestPractices.pdf
- 4. ICRC: https://www.in.gov/icrc/

