Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board Minutes
January 20, 2016
Indiana Government Conference Center
Conference Room “C”
302 West Washington Street
Indianapolis, Indiana 46204

Board members present: Deputy-Director Chris Smith; DNR, Chairman; Jim Corridan; Beth McCord; April Sievert; Scott Keller

Staff members present: DHPA Director Mitch Zoll, Paul Diebold, Holly Tate, Amy Borland, Chad Slider, Ashley Thomas, Steve Kennedy, David Duvall, Cathy Draeger-Williams, John Carr; and Susan Judy of DHPA

Visitors/Speakers present included: Mark Dollase; Kathleen Day; Ron Flick; Jeff Koehler; Robert Hostetler; Tommy Kleckner; John Davis; Alan J. DeLaunay; Herman Giles, Jr.; Teresa Randall; Mike Waggoner; Jodi Griggs; Char Ottinger; Laura Barton

Call to Order

Deputy Director Chris Smith convened the meeting at 2:10 P. M.
Deputy Director Smith introduced himself and opened the meeting.

The minutes from the October 21, 2015 board meeting were approved. Motion to approve was made by Jim Corridan and seconded by Beth McCord.

Deputy Director Smith stated that the agenda will be slightly out of order from that of the agenda. He requested the Division Director’s report.

Division Director’s Report:

(The director’s report was shortened due to the length of the agenda)

The statewide Preserving Historic Places conference will be held between April 26th and 28th in Vincennes, IN.

The DHPA partners with Indiana University and Indiana Landmarks to host the annual Preserving Historic Places: Indiana’s Statewide Preservation Conference. This statewide conference is the official forum for preservation issues in Indiana.

Relevant session topics are chosen based on the host community. Speakers include nationally known preservationists. The conference features plenary and concurrent sessions, keynote speakers and tours of preservation highlights in the host community.
DHPA will present SHAARD and SHAARD GIS training at the Section 106 Workshop in Vincennes on April 26, 2016.

**Historic Preservation Fund (HPF) Grant Applications for Federal FY 2016**

The chair first called for Agenda item V, Historic Preservation Fund Grants. This year, 16 Historic Preservation Fund grant proposals were received requesting a grand total of $640,788.

Congress has passed the Department of the Interior’s spending bill, which sets the Historic Preservation Fund at level funding from Federal Fiscal Year 2015. Although we do not yet have a precise state allocation figure from the National Park Service, we know that it will be approximately $916,250.

The Grants Staff has already finalized the budget for the use of this year’s HPF allocation and, consistent with the last several years, has targeted approximately $375,000 for distribution as subgrants. Approximately $130,000 of additional funding is budgeted for planned cooperative agreement projects and one major research contract. Together, these amounts will hold our pass-through distribution rate at about 55% of the total award, which is also very consistent with recent years.

**Certified Local Government Proposals**

CLG statistics and funding recommendations may be found on Page 3 of your packet. Indiana’s required minimum 10% CLG pass-through amount for FY2016 is estimated to be approximately $92,000.

This year, two CLG subgrant proposals were received as well as one CLG cooperative agreement proposal for the next phase of survey in Allen County. Together, these three requests will exceed $100,000 – which will easily satisfy the 10% minimum pass-through requirement.

Therefore, it is not necessary to consider CLG proposals as a separate grant category this year.

**Architectural and Historical Proposals**

The first category for the Board’s consideration is that of Architectural & Historical projects. Two proposals were received requesting a total of $11,641. Both proposals scored high enough on the Administrative Criteria to be recommended for funding.

Funding these two small proposals will leave a significant amount of funds remaining in this category. Therefore, staff recommends transferring all of the remaining funds – about $44,600 – to the Archaeological Category in order to help offset the greater demand for archaeology grant funding and help provide full funding for one additional project.

**Archaeological Proposals**

Four proposals were received requesting a total of $176,247. All four proposals scored high enough on the Administrative Criteria to be recommended for funding.

Based on the funds available for this category, plus the remaining funds transferred from the Architectural & Historical category, funding the top three proposals will leave some funds unused. Therefore, staff recommends transferring all of the remaining funds – about $30,850 – to the
Acquisition and Development Category in order to help offset the greater demand for rehab grant funding and to help provide full funding for one additional project.

**Acquisition and Development Proposals**

Ten proposals were received requesting a total of $452,900. Two proposals did not score the required minimum of 65.0 points on the Administrative Criteria and cannot be recommended for funding.

Based on the funds available for this category, plus the remaining funds transferred from the Archaeological category, staff believes that the five top-ranked projects will receive full funding.

A motion to approve was made by Jim Corridan and seconded by Scott Keller. The motion was approved unanimously.

**State Certificates of Approval**

The chair then called for Agenda item IV, Certificates of Approval.

1. Certificate of approval application for the expansion of the Dearborn County Courthouse, Lawrenceburg, Dearborn County; Chad Slider gave the staff comments. Slider noted that because the expansion is funded with casino revenues which are then disbursed by the State of Indiana, a certificate of approval is required under state law. Slider explained that the courthouse is listed in the National and State Registers as part of the Downtown Lawrenceburg Historic District. Slider then discussed the nature of the addition, which would be to the rear of the historic courthouse, and would connect it to a 1980s annex that is currently free-standing. The rear wall of the historic courthouse would be visible inside in the new addition. Teresa Randall, Dearborn County Administrator, spoke on behalf of the project, stating that the county is excited to be continuing the use of one of Indiana’s oldest functioning courthouses. There was discussion between the applicants, staff, and board regarding possible archaeological deposits that might be found on site. Motion to approve subject to conditions noted in the staff comment was made by Beth McCord and seconded by April Sievert. The motion was approved unanimously.

2. Certificate of approval application for the property improvements near and within Wyandotte Cave, O’Bannon Woods State Park, Crawford County; Cathy Draeger-Williams gave the staff comments. It was noted that the current visitor’s center has been so greatly modified that staff believes it is not eligible for the state or National Register. A motion to approve, subject to conditions in the staff comments was made by Jim Corridan and seconded by Beth McCord. The motion was approved unanimously.

3. Certificate of approval application for the demolition of Simpson Hall, located on the campus of the Indiana School for the Deaf, Indianapolis, Washington Township, Marion County; David Duvall gave the staff comments. He summarized the past certificate of approval requests made to the Board, including a 1977 request that included both Simpson Hall (the Girls Dorm) and the Boys Dorm. The Boys Dorm, similar in appearance to Simpson Hall, was removed at that time. In 1991 the historic (pre-1945) buildings of the
Deaf School were listed on the State and National Registers as a district. Finally, Duvall noted the appropriation of funds in 2015 to demolish Simpson Hall. The area is to be sodded for parking during the State Fair. Duvall also noted the recommended conditions as stated by staff, should the Board grant a certificate of approval. Several people signed up to speak about what action should be taken about this application. They include Mark Dollase, Ron Flick, Kathleen Day; all opposed the action. Dollase stated that Matthew Moore, editor of Deaf Life, believes that the Indiana Deaf School campus is nationally rare. Dollase stated that there had been little marketing of the building, and that its location makes it suitable for elderly residential housing. He stated the Deaf School administrators had expressed reluctance to reusing the building during past meetings, but the current superintendent is more open to discussions, and Indiana Landmarks would like to pursue ideas with them. Dollase asked if the Board could table this agenda item until the April, 2016 meeting. Kathleen Day is a graduate student at Ball State and is using Simpson Hall as a thesis project. She asked for three more months to study reuse options. Ron Flick, architect, spoke on behalf of saving the building. He noted that the building has structural problems and deterioration but he feels it can be reused. According to Flick, it would take $15-20 million to convert the building to housing, a small museum, and conference center, but is feasible technically. Jodi Griggs is a graduate of Indiana School for the Deaf, and former resident of Simpson Hall. She requested more time for interested parties to study reuse of the building. Char Ottinger, former Dean of Girls at the Deaf School, similarly asked for time to study the building for reuse. Jason Larrison spoke for the action. He stated that the Deaf School has asked IDOA to handle their request. The Deaf School has no funds to support maintenance or reuse of the building, and they have no programs that could use the building. Larrison noted all the various deteriorating elements and factors that have resulted in the current state of the building. Larrison doubted that three months would make a great difference, and so, was willing to defer demolition up to October, 2016 (at that meeting of the Board), provided that at each meeting in between, solid evidence of progress to reuse the building is presented to IDOA, the Deaf School, and DHPA. Larrison also noted that any reuse must be compatible with the operation of the Deaf School. Jim Corridan moved to table the motion until next meeting in April, with the request that evidence of progress to reuse the building be presented at that time. It was seconded by Scott Keller. The motion was approved unanimously.

4. Certificate of approval application for a roadway reconstruction project on US 52 from Blue Creek Road to Butlers Run, in the Town of Brookville, Franklin County; John Carr gave the staff comments. Carr noted that one effect of the project is that basement access points, such as below-sidewalk coal chutes and covers, basement windows, will have to be blocked on some historic buildings in the Brookville Historic District, since sidewalks are being rebuilt as part of the project. Some limestone curbing may be replaced during the project as well. Carr noted the staff-recommended conditions. Alan J. DeLaunay, engineer, spoke in support of the project. Beth McCord made motion to approve per staff conditions as noted in the staff comment and April Sievert seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

5. Certificate of approval application for the demolition of the Model Farm House at the Indiana State Fairgrounds, Marion County; Chad Slider gave the staff comments. Slider noted that the building is historic under state law (IC 14-21-1-18) because the Indiana
State Fair Grounds is a district eligible for the State and National Registers. The Model Farm House was built as New Deal demonstration project in the late 1930s. Slider noted the various reuse attempts that the Fair Commission has made. He also noted that estimates to completely rehab the building amount to around $200,000, according to contractors’ estimates provided to the Fair Commission. Slider noted the staff recommendations, should the Board grant a certificate of approval. Board members asked Slider several questions. Scott Keller asked about the nature of documentation, and if it approaches that of HABS (Historic American Building Survey). Mark Dollase opposes the action. He asked about the nature of the reuse options pursued by the Fair Commission. He asked why Indiana Landmarks was not consulted. Laura Barton, of the Fair Commission, explained the various reuse options that had been pursued, including offices for Davis Homes, the Future Farmers of America, and Indy Recycling, all of which had declined the building ultimately. She also stated that Marsh Davis of Indiana Landmarks had been invited to tour the building already. Next, the Board asked questions of the applicant. Corridan asked if a plan could be made to reuse the building, would the Fair Commission be amenable. Chairman Smith asked Dollase to meet with the Fair Commission and pursue options. April Sievert made a motion to table the item until the April 2016 meeting. Jim Corridan seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

6. Certificate of approval application for the replacement of Bridge 026-79-03346B, carrying SR 26 over the south fork of Wildcat Creek, Perry Township, Tippecanoe County. Ashley Thomas gave the staff comments. The bridge is eligible for the State and National Registers, according to the statewide bridge inventory. A 2014 report noted the structural deficiencies of the bridge. It appears that there is no viable alternative, and no responses to attempts to market the bridge for reuse have been received. Thomas noted the staff-recommended conditions. Beth McCord made a motion to approve. April Sievert seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

7. Certificate of approval application for the repair of Bridge No. 135-55-01522A, carrying SR 135 over Indian Creek, Jackson Township, Morgan County; Ashley Thomas gave the staff comments. In October 2015, the bridge was damaged by an auto. Staff favors the application, and Thomas stated the staff conditions recommended for this item. Raina Regan of Indiana Landmarks asked about the timeline for repairs; Mary Kennedy of INDOT answered that as soon as possible, maybe May 2016. Motion to approve was made by Beth McCord and seconded by Jim Corridan. Motion approved unanimously.

8. Certificate of approval application to construct a replacement bridge approximately 20 feet to the south of the existing SR 46 bridge over the Eel River (Bridge No. 046-11-01316C), located 2.8 miles east of SR 59, near the community of Bowling Green in Clay County; to dismantle the two spans of the existing SR 46 bridge; and to relocate, rehabilitate, and reassemble the two spans at separate crossings of Salt Creek on a trail being developed in Brown County.

John Carr gave staff comments. Carr noted that since the board last met, the additional National Register documentation and information about moving the bridge as two separate spans to Brown County were forwarded to the NPS as requested by the board, with mixed results. The additional documentation was approved, making the bridge significant under
NR criterion C in addition to its initial listing under Criterion A. The proposed relocation as two separate spans in Brown County was denied by NPS. Carr continued, stating that this request from INDOT was a separate request for review under state law (IC 14-21-1-18). The Clay County Commissioners have voted to not accept responsibility for the bridge if it is rehabilitated in place by INDOT. It was noted that the bridge is need of repair. Carr noted the recommended conditions by staff should a certificate be granted by the board. Mary Kennedy, INDOT, spoke on behalf of the project. She recounted the history of the bridge and specified the serious repairs needed for it to continue in use, even as a pedestrian bridge. She also recounted the history of public meetings and notices regarding the proposal to move the bridge to Brown County. She also offered three additional concepts for mitigation that are fully described in their submittal. Public comments followed. A great many people commented on this bridge and its proposed relocation. Tommy Kleckner, Indiana Landmarks, opposed the action and felt that the Bowling Green community was unduly pressured to give up the idea of keeping the bridge in its original location. Kleckner wondered if this means the statewide bridges programmatic agreement cannot be enforced, because the bridge is a select bridge, meaning INDOT agreed to preserve it. Jeff Koehler, Clay County Historian, spoke next. He stated that Clay County citizens hired the consultant to nominate the bridge some years ago, and he favors keeping the bridge on its current site. John Davis, Bureau Chief for DNR, stated that if moved as proposed, DNR and INDOT would place markers on the original site and proposed site explaining the bridge’s history. Potentially, a public access site for the river might be created at the original site of the bridge. Robert Hostetler of Clay Co. noted that the bridge is now rare and is a select bridge (as Kleckner had noted). Mike Waggoner, of Brown County Highway Dept., spoke on behalf of moving the bridge spans to Brown County. Next came questions from the board. Scott Keller asked Mary Kennedy what would happen to the bridge if the board denies the certificate of approval. After discussion, including some comments from Mark Dollase, Mary Kennedy stated that INDOT would have to rehabilitate the bridge in place due to the bridges programmatic agreement. At this point, Chris Smith introduced a motion to accept the C of A. Beth McCord seconded the motion. The vote was taken, with Smith and McCord voting for and Scott Keller, April Sievert, and Jim Corridan voting against. Motion failed to pass.

**National Register Applications**

Smith returned to agenda item II, National Register nominations. The board wished to approve the nomination en mass, with one exception.

1. **Studebaker-Railroad Corridor Historic District**, roughly bounded by United Drive, W. South St., S. Main St., and an alley north of W. Sample St., South Bend, St. Joseph County (2404)

   Staff indicated that the owners have asked the board to table the item; staff has indicated to the applicant that this will place them at the back of the line for substantive review.

2. **Clampitt Site**, Lawrence County (2405)
3. Indianapolis Public Library, Branch No. 3 (East Washington), 2822 E. Washington St., Indianapolis, Marion County (2409)

4. Indianapolis Public Library, Branch No. 6 (Spades Park), 1801 Nowland Ave., Indianapolis, Marion County (2410)

5. Oriental Lodge Number 500 (Prince Hall Masonic Temple), 2201 Central Ave., Indianapolis, Marion County (2412)

6. Simpson-Breedlove House, 3650 South U.S. Highway 421, Zionsville, Boone County (2414)

7. Erwin House, 2518 14B Road, Bourbon vicinity, Marshall County (2416)

Staff presented no comments on items #2-7. From the audience, Herman Giles, Jr. wanted to express his thanks to the Board for consideration of the National Register nomination for item #5, Oriental Lodge. The board voted to table item #1 until its turn comes up in the substantive review queue. Corridan made a motion to adopt all criteria cited by staff in their staff comments regarding items #2-7 and approve all nominations in items #2-7. Sievert seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

**Report by INDOT under guidelines for emergency action using state funds, for emergency repairs to the S.R. 135 bridge over Indian Creek (Bridge #135-55-01522A), Morgan County**

The board returned to item III. Mary Kennedy reported on the emergency repairs to the same bridge that had been granted a certificate of approval under item #7 of the certificates of approval. Mary Kennedy reported that an auto had hit the bridge, damaging several structural members. Temporary repairs were done to reopen the bridge; a major rehabilitation of the bridge is planned as specified under the certificate of approval.

**Properties Listed in, Rejected by, or Removed from the National Register since the last Notification**

**Listed**

**HUNTINGTON COUNTY,**
Chenoweth-Coulter Farm, 7067 S. Etna Rd., LaFontaine vicinity, 09000426, ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTATION APPROVED, 12/15/15

**JOHNSON COUNTY,**
Bethel African Methodist Episcopal Church, 499 W. Madison St., Franklin, 15000886, LISTED, 12/15/15

**MARION COUNTY,**
Indianapolis Athletic Club, 350 N. Meridian St., Indianapolis, 15000887, LISTED, 12/15/15
MARSHALL COUNTY,
Bourbon Community Building--Gymnasium, 800 N. Harris St., Bourbon,  15000888, LISTED, 12/15/15 (Indiana's Public Common and High Schools MPS)

TIPPECANOE COUNTY,
Happy Hollow Heights Historic District, 1821 & 1809 Happy Hollow Rd., all houses on Laurel, Hollowood, Fearnleaf & Sumac Drs., West Lafayette,  15000891, LISTED, 12/15/15

WAYNE COUNTY,
Forest Hills Country Club, 2169 S. 23rd St., Richmond,  15000892, LISTED, 12/15/15

Rejected
None

Removed

MIAMI COUNTY,
Paw Paw Creek Bridge No. 52, Paw Paw Pike over Paw Paw Creek, Chili vicinity (STORM DAMAGE/DISASSEMBLED) DELISTED 10/13/15

Other

Set date for next meeting:
Smith noted the date and special location of the next meeting.

Proposed date: April 20, 2016, Indiana Statehouse, House Committee Room 156a, 2:00 p.m.
Deadline for receipt of Certificate of Approval applications: March 11, 2016, 4:45 p.m.

The meeting adjourned at 5:04 pm.