

July 16, 2007

Brad Bohrer, Senior Counsel  
First American Real Estate Solutions  
4 First American Way  
Santa Ana, California 92707

*Re: Formal Complaint 07-FC-158; Alleged Violation of the Access to Public Records Act by the Carroll County Auditor*

Dear Mr. Bohrer:

This is in response to your formal complaint alleging the Carroll County Auditor (“Auditor”) violated the Access to Public Records Act (“APRA”) (Ind. Code 5-14-3) by denying your request for an electronic copy of the most recent tax/assessment roll. I find that the Carroll County Auditor is required by the APRA to provide an electronic copy of the requested records and may charge you a fee not to exceed the direct cost of providing the records in the electronic format you request.

#### BACKGROUND

You allege you first requested an electronic copy of the most recent tax/assessment roll from the Auditor on July 24, 2006. On September 18, 2006, the Auditor denied your request, indicating the Carroll County Board of Commissioners had voted not to provide the access requested. You submitted a new request to the Auditor on May 8, 2007. On May 17, the Auditor denied the request, indicating the records are available during business hours at the public terminal. In further conversations with Barry Emerson, County Attorney, you were told you would be provided the records you requested but you would be required to pay some percentage of the county’s annual maintenance cost to its record management system vendor. You provided Mr. Emerson with a copy of my predecessor’s opinion in 07-FC-130 regarding such costs. On June 13, Mr. Emerson advised you that Auditor had instructed the vendor to provide you with the records in the electronic format you requested. No specific information was provided regarding cost to you. To date you have not received the records.

You submitted your complaint to this office on June 14, 2007. The Auditor did not provide a response to your complaint.

## ANALYSIS

The Carroll County Auditor's office is a public agency for the purposes of the Access to Public Records Act. IC 5-14-3-2(l).

The public policy of the APRA is that all persons are entitled to full and complete information regarding the affairs of government and the official acts of those who represent them as public officials and employees. Providing persons with the information is an essential function of a representative government and an integral part of the routine duties of public officials and employees, whose duty it is to provide the information. IC 5-14-3-1.

Any person may inspect and copy the public records of any public agency during the regular business hours of the agency, except as provided in section 4 of the Access to Public Records Act. IC 5-14-3-3(a). "Public record" means any writing, paper, report, study, map, photograph, book, card, tape recording, or other material that is created, received, maintained, or filed by or with a public agency and which is generated on paper, paper substitutes, photographic media, chemically based media, magnetic or machine readable media, electronically stored data, or any other material, regardless of form or characteristics. IC 5-14-3-2(m).

If (1) a person is entitled to a copy of a public record under this chapter; and (2) the public agency which is in possession of the record has reasonable access to a machine capable of reproducing the record; the public agency must provide at least one copy of the public record to the person. IC 5-14-3-8(e). The public agency may charge a fee, uniform to all purchasers, that does not exceed the agency's direct cost of supplying the information in that form. IC 5-14-3-8(g).

A public agency that maintains or contracts for the maintenance of public records in an electronic data storage system shall make reasonable efforts to provide to a person making a request a copy of all disclosable data contained in the records on paper, disk, tape, drum or any other method of electronic retrieval if the medium requested is compatible with the agency's data storage system. IC 5-14-3-3.

It is my understanding you have requested the records in an electronic format (via 4mm, DAT, CD-ROM, email or FTP). Further, I understand from your complaint and attachments the Auditor's vendor, Manatron, is relatively easily able to create a copy of the public records you request. I do not understand it to be the case the medium you request is incompatible with the Auditor's data storage system or that you are asking the Auditor to reprogram its system to provide you with the records you request. If these elements are indeed true, I find the Auditor is required to provide a copy of the record to you pursuant to IC 5-14-3-8(e). Further, the Auditor may charge you a fee not to exceed the direct cost of supplying the information in the requested form.

## CONCLUSION

For the foregoing reasons, I find that the Carroll County Auditor is required by the APRA to provide an electronic copy of the requested records and may charge you a fee not to exceed the direct cost of providing the records in the electronic format you request.

Best regards,

Heather Willis Neal  
Public Access Counselor

cc: Beth Myers, Carroll County Auditor

*N.B. The nature of the complaint in 07-FC-158 is similar to several other complaints filed by your office on the same date, specifically 07-FC-159, 07-FC-160, 07-FC-163, 07-FC-164, and 07-FC-165. Because the facts as well as responses from the County Auditor differ in each case, I have issued separate opinions. To the extent there are similar facts from one complaint to another not necessarily provided by the Auditor, my finding in the respective complaint should be construed as being the same as that in the complaint with the most similar fact pattern. For instance, if another county has an ordinance similar to that in 07-FC-163, the presence of such an ordinance prohibiting commercial use of the information would change my opinion.*