STATE OF INDIANA
Michael R. Pence, Governor

DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATION
Commissioner's Office
Indiana Government Center South
402 West Washington Street, Room W469
Indianapolis, IN 46204

**Award Recommendation Letter**

Date: July 10, 2014

To: Justin Weidner, Director of Strategic Sourcing JW
Indiana Department of Administration

From: Eric Klinefelter, Strategic Sourcing Analyst

Subject: Recommendation of Selection for RFP 14-075, Hard Copy Book Collections

**Estimated Amount of Two Year Contract:** No cost to the State (QPA for public libraries)

Based on the evaluation of responses to Request for Proposal 14-075, it is the evaluation team's recommendation that **Baker & Taylor, Inc.** and **Cengage Learning, Inc.** be selected to begin contract negotiations to provide Hard Copy Book Collections for the Indiana State Library and Education Service Centers.

Terms of this recommendation are included in this letter.

The evaluation team received proposals from four (4) vendors:

- Baker & Taylor, Inc.
- Cengage Learning, Inc.
- Ingram Library Services Inc.
- Mackin Book Company

According to the following criterions, which were published in Section 3, Proposal Evaluation, of the RFP, proposals were evaluated by Indiana Department of Administration ("IDOA") and scored by the evaluation team:

- Adherence to Requirements (Pass/Fail)
- Management Assessment/Quality (30 points)
- Cost Proposal (30 points)
- Indiana Economic Impact (5 points)
- Buy Indiana (10 points)
- Minority Business Participation (10 points plus one bonus point if certain criteria are met)
- Woman-Owned Business Participation (10 points plus one bonus point if certain criteria are met)
- Indiana Veteran Business Enterprise Subcontractor Commitment (5 points plus one bonus point if certain criteria are met)

The proposals were evaluated according to the process outlined in section 3.2 ("Evaluation Criteria") of the RFP. Scoring was completed as follows:

## A. Adherence to Requirements

All proposals were reviewed for adherence to mandatory requirements. All of the respondents adhered to the mandatory requirements and were then evaluated based on their business proposal, technical proposal, and cost proposal.

## B. Management Assessment/Quality ("MAQ")

### Business Proposal

For the business proposal evaluation, IDOA assessed and the evaluation team scored the respondent's ability to serve the State in the following areas:

- Company structure
- Financial information
- References
- Experience serving similar clients
- Experience serving state governments

### Technical Proposal

For the technical proposal evaluation, the evaluation team scored the respondent's proposal in the following areas:

- Product Offering
- Online Capabilities and Ordering
- Customer Service and Account Management
- Order Processing/Retail
- Shipping and Delivery
- Reporting

The evaluation team's scores were based on a review of the respondent's proposed approach to each section of the technical proposal and subsequent clarifications.

Results of the management assessment/quality evaluation for all categories are shown below:

**Table 1: MAQ Scores**

| RESPONDENT | MAQ SCORE (30 Points) |
|---|---|
| Baker & Taylor, Inc. | 24.50 |
| Cengage Learning, Inc. | 17.31 |
| Ingram Library Services, Inc. | 21.56 |
| Mackin Book Company | 18.63 |

## C. Cost Proposal

Cost scores were normalized based on the largest percentage discount off publisher list price offered in each category. The largest percentage discount off publisher list price by category receives all of the available points. Other proposals received scores based on the following normalization formula:

*Respondent's Cost Score = (Percentage Discount per Category / Largest Percentage Discount per Category) X 30*

The scores were then averaged across all applicable categories to determine the respondent's final cost score.

Total average cost scores were calculated for each respondent across categories bid to determine initial cost scores. Initial cost scores are as follows:

**Table 2: Initial Cost Scores**

| RESPONDENT | COST SCORE (30 points) |
|---|---|
| Baker & Taylor, Inc. | 24.17 |
| Cengage Learning, Inc. | 26.90 |
| Ingram Library Services, Inc. | 21.79 |
| Mackin Book Company | 17.98 |

**D. Total Scores**

**Table 3: MAQ + Initial Cost Score**

| RESPONDENT | MAQ SCORE (30 max) | COST SCORE (30 max) | TOTAL SCORE (60 max) |
|---|---|---|---|
| Baker & Taylor, Inc. | 24.50 | 24.17 | 48.67 |
| Cengage Learning, Inc. | 17.31 | 26.90 | 44.21 |
| Ingram Library Services, Inc. | 21.56 | 21.79 | 43.35 |
| Mackin Book Company | 18.63 | 17.98 | 36.61 |

All respondents were deemed viable for contract award and advanced to the final evaluation. Prior to further evaluation, IDOA dispatched a request for the Best and Final offer ("BAFO"). The updated scoring is reflected in Table 4 below.

**E. Short Listing**

**Table 4: MAQ + BAFO Score**

| RESPONDENT | MAQ SCORE (30 max) | COST SCORE (30 max) | TOTAL SCORE (60 max) |
|---|---|---|---|
| Baker & Taylor, Inc. | 24.50 | 23.00 | 47.50 |
| Cengage Learning, Inc. | 17.31 | 28.02 | 45.33 |
| Ingram Library Services, Inc. | 21.56 | 18.00 | 39.56 |
| Mackin Book Company | 18.63 | 17.99 | 36.62 |

There was a clear and natural break among the respondents. As such, Ingram Library Services and Mackin Book Company were eliminated. The two remaining respondents were deemed viable for contract award and advanced to the final evaluation.

**F. IDOA Scoring**

IDOA scored the respondents in the following areas using criteria published in the RFP:

Buy Indiana (10 points); Indiana Economic Impact (5 points); Minority and Women Business Participation (10 points each); and Indiana Veteran's Business Participation (5 points.

When necessary, IDOA clarified certain Buy Indiana, Indiana Economic Impact, Minority and Women Business Participation and Indiana Veteran's Business participation information with the respondents. Results of these scores are tabulated in Table 4 below.

**Table 4: Final Overall Evaluation Scores**

| Respondent | MAQ SCORE (30 max) | COST SCORE (30 max) | Buy Indiana (10 max) | Indiana Economic Impact (5 max) | MBE (10 max + 1 bonus) | WBE (10 max + 1 bonus) | IVBE (5 max +1 bonus) | TOTAL SCORE (100 max + 3 bonus) |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Baker & Taylor, Inc. | 24.50 | 23.00 | 0.00 | 0.04 | -1.00 | -1.00 | -1.00 | 44.54 |
| Cengage Learning, Inc. | 17.31 | 28.02 | 0.00 | 5.00 | -1.00 | -1.00 | -1.00 | 47.33 |

**Award Summary**

During the course of evaluation, the State scrutinized proposals to determine the viability of the proposed business solutions to meet the goals of the program and the needs of the State. The team evaluated the proposals based on the stipulated criteria outlined in the RFP. Both proposals provide the State and other governmental entities a comprehensive product offering paired with an aggressive discount structure.

The term of the contract shall be for a period of two (2) years from the date of contract execution. Renewals of the contract will be by mutual agreement, for up to two (2) one-year periods.

Eric Klinefelter, Strategic Sourcing Analyst
Indiana Department of Administration