

Attachment A

Evaluation Criteria Scoring Details

| | Criteria | Points |
|---|---|--------|
| A | Cost effectiveness of project (\$ per ton of NOx reduced). | 25 |
| B | Project's total NOx emission reduction potential (based on type of project and/or the use of vehicle). | 20 |
| C | NAAQS sensitive areas as a percentage of current standards. | 15 |
| D | Air quality benefits to areas with sensitive populations or that bear a disproportionate share of the air pollution burden. | 10 |
| E | Transformational potential (potential to prove or maximize effectiveness of newer technology). | 10 |
| F | Leveraging of resources (financial or resource match). | 10 |
| G | Longevity, sustainability, and magnification of effect of emission reduction benefits. | 10 |
| H | BONUS: Bonus points will be provided to Indiana owned and operated business enterprises (include Indiana Economic Impact documentation). | 5 |
| I | BONUS: Active participant in the State of Indiana Minority/Women/Veterans Business Enterprise Participation Plan (include MBE/WBE/VBE documentation). | 5 |

Proposed Grouping and Scoring Approach

A. Project Grouping

- a. Projects will be scored against like projects based on carve-outs, not directly against different sectors. For example:
 - i. Electric school buses vs. electric school buses (as carved out)
 - ii. School buses (non-electric) vs. School buses (non-electric) – (as carved out)
 - iii. Onroad (excepting school buses) equipment/vehicles vs. Onroad (excepting school buses) equipment/vehicles
 - iv. Nonroad equipment/vehicles vs. Nonroad equipment/vehicles

B. Project Scoring Approach

- a. **Cost effectiveness of project (\$ per ton of NOx reduced) – 25 Points**
 - i. Calculated using U.S. EPA's Diesel Emission Quantifier (DEQ)

- ii. Applicant will be provided a template and required to submit the detailed information necessary for a DEQ run (i.e. existing equipment/vehicle tier/model year, replacement equipment/vehicle tier/model year, fuel consumption, miles driven, hours of operation, etc.)
- iii. Several options for how these might be used:
 - 1. Use all the submitted data from applicant as provided for DEQ run (which might be skewed based on their inputs)
 - 2. Use some of the submitted data from the application for DEQ run, while using DEQ defaults for certain categories such as fuel used, idling hours, miles driven, hours operated, remaining life of equipment/vehicle etc. (resulting in consistent evaluation of projects and removing potentially skewed input data from applicant)
 - 3. Use all of the submitted data from the applicant with maximum levels set at DEQ defaults (resulting in closer to actual results without potentially skewed data on the higher ends)
- iv. Each group (as described above) scored against each other based on DEQ “Lifetime Cost Effectiveness (\$/short ton reduced) with highest point amount (25) being based on project with lowest cost per short ton reduced.
 - 1. 25 points – 90% - 100% of most cost-effective project
 - 2. 20 points – 80% - 89% of most cost-effective project
 - 3. 15 points – 70% - 79% of most cost-effective project
 - 4. 10 points – 60% - 69% of most cost-effective project
 - 5. 5 points – 50% - 59% of most cost-effective project
 - 6. 0 points – 49% or lower of most cost-effective project

B. Project’s total NO_x emission reduction potential (based on type of project and/or the use of vehicle). – 20 Points

- i. Calculated using U.S. EPA’s Diesel Emission Quantifier (DEQ)
- ii. Applicant will be provided and required to submit the detailed information necessary for a DEQ run
- iii. Several options for how these might be used:
 - 1. Use all the submitted data from applicant as provided for DEQ run (which might be skewed based on their inputs)
 - 2. Use some of the submitted data from the application for DEQ run, while using DEQ defaults for certain categories such as fuel used, idling hours, miles driven, hours operated, etc. (resulting in consistent evaluation of projects and removing potentially skewed input data from applicant)
 - 3. Use all of the submitted data from the applicant with maximum levels set at DEQ defaults (resulting in closer to actual results without potentially skewed data on the higher ends)

- iv. Each group (as described above) scored against each other based on DEQ “Lifetime Results (short ton reduced) with highest point amount (25) being based on project with highest lifetime short ton reduction.
 - 1. 25 points – 90% - 100% of highest reduction project
 - 2. 20 points – 80% - 89% of highest reduction project
 - 3. 15 points – 70% - 79% of highest reduction project
 - 4. 10 points – 60% - 69% of highest reduction project
 - 5. 5 points – 50% - 59% of highest reduction project
 - 6. 0 points – 49% or lower of highest reduction project

C. NAAQS sensitive areas as a percentage of current standards. – 15 Points

- a. Using most recent IDEM calculated 3-year design values
 - i. 15 points – Located in an area designated as nonattainment or maintenance for both Ozone or PM2.5
 - ii. 10 points – Located in an area with monitor values above the standard for either Ozone or PM2.5
 - iii. 8 points – within 95% of current Ozone or PM2.5 standard
 - iv. 6 points – within 90% of current Ozone or PM2.5 standard
 - v. 4 points – within 85% of current Ozone or PM2.5 standard
 - vi. 2 points – within 80% of current Ozone or PM2.5 standard
 - vii. 0 points – below 80% of current Ozone or PM2.5 standard

D. Air quality benefits to areas with sensitive populations or that bear a disproportionate share of the air pollution burden. – 10 Points

- a. Using US EPA’s most recent National Air Toxics Assessment (NATA) diesel exposure values
 - i. 10 points – 0.90 – 1.40 micrograms/cubic meter
 - ii. 5 points – 0.45-0.90 micrograms/cubic meter
 - iii. 0 points – below 0.45 micrograms/cubic meter
- b. Alternative - Using asthma rates for emergency room/hospital stays
 - i. 10 points – highest 1/3 of counties
 - ii. 5 points – middle 1/3 of counties
 - iii. 0 points – lowest 1/3 of counties

E. Transformational potential (potential to prove or maximize effectiveness of newer technology). – 10 Points

- a. Lasting effect
 - i. 10 points – Proposals that notably change standard operating practices through transition to a new fuel infrastructure that did not exist for that entity previously or uniquely addresses current use of equipment/vehicles
 - ii. 5 points – Proposals that have initiated the transition to cleaner equipment/vehicles (i.e., applicant has already begun converting to cleaner equipment/vehicles and additional funding might complete that transition)

- iii. 3 points – project takes place in a uniquely overburdened location (i.e., railyard located next to neighborhood)
- iv. 0 points

F. Leveraging of resources (financial or resource match). – 10 Points

- a. Using minimum required applicant match as 0-point starting level
 - i. 10 points – 75% more than required match of project
 - ii. 8 points – 50% more than required match of project
 - iii. 6 points – 25% more than required match of project
 - iv. 4 points – 10% more than required match of project
 - v. 2 points – 5% more than required match of project
 - vi. 0 points – only required match of project

G. Longevity, sustainability, and magnification of effect of emission reduction benefits. – 10 Points

- a. Using US EPA Diesel Emission Quantifier default lifecycle
 - i. 10 points – 20 or more year lifecycle of equipment or vehicle
 - ii. 8 points – 15- 19 year lifecycle of equipment or vehicle
 - iii. 6 points – 12 – 14 year lifecycle of equipment or vehicle
 - iv. 4 points – 7 – 11 year lifecycle of equipment or vehicle
 - v. 2 points – 5 - 8 year lifecycle of equipment or vehicle
 - vi. 0 points – less than 5 year lifecycle of equipment or vehicle

H. BONUS: Bonus points will be provided to entities registered with the Indiana Secretary of State do conduct taxable business practices in Indiana. – 5 Points

- a. Using Indiana Secretary of State Business Services Division for reference
 - i. 5 points – Applicant registered as Indiana business
 - ii. 3 points – Applicant registered as Indiana business with main/corporate offices outside of Indiana
 - iii. 0 points – Applicant not registered as Indiana business

I. BONUS: Active participant in the State of Indiana Minority/Women/Veterans Business Enterprise Participation Plan (include MBE/WBE/VBE documentation). – 5 Points

- a. Using Indiana Department of Administration for reference
 - i. 5 points – Applicant is MBE/WBE/VBE certified
 - ii. 3 points – Applicant using contractor that is MBE/WBE/VBE certified
 - iii. 0 points – No certification of applicant or contractor